United Nations Human Rights Council (UNHRC) Universal Periodic Review of the Republic of Rwanda

I. Background

1. Jubilee Campaign, in special consultative status with ECOSOC, submits this analysis of religious freedom and human rights in the Republic of Rwanda as a contribution to the Universal Periodic Review of the UNHRC member-state Rwanda.

II. Scope of international obligations and cooperation with international human rights mechanisms and bodies

- 2. Rwanda has ratified the Convention on Torture and Other Cruel Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment; the Optional Protocol of the Convention against Torture; the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights; the Second Optional Protocol to the International Convention on Civil and Political Rights aiming to the abolition of the death penalty; the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women; the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination; the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families; the Convention on the Rights of the Child; the Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the involvement of children in armed conflict; the Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the child prostitution and child pornography; and the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities.
- 3. Rwanda has not ratified the Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance.

Recommendation(s)

Jubilee Campaign urges the Republic of Rwanda to:

- 4. Ratify the Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance.
- III. Implementation of international human rights obligations, considering applicable international humanitarian law

A. Freedom of thought, conscience, and religion

- 5. Article 4 of the Constitution of Rwanda clarifies that Rwanda is a secular state; this constitution also does not establish a state religion.
- 6. Article 37 of the Constitution of Rwanda states that "freedom of thought, conscience, religion, worship and public manifestation thereof is guaranteed by the State in accordance with the law."
- 7. Still Rwanda recently implemented a new legislation that requires faith-based organizations (FBOs) to apply for legal status before engaging in any activities. Moreover, leaders of these organizations must have academic degrees. This presents an obstacle hindering religious groups and organizations from freely practicing.
- 8. In August 2018, approximately 8,000 churches and religious organizations were shut down in response to this new law. The new requirements of this law also include that pastors must have a degree in theological education from an accredited school, but also includes physical requirements regarding the church building such as the distance from the toilet to the church entrance, presence of lightning-conductors and other requirements. The issue many churches have raised is that this law has been enforced before being approved officially. In addition the law gives an almost impossible timeframe of 15 days for the churches to make the required changes, churches which are often struggling financially.¹
- 9. On February 17, 2020, famous Rwandan gospel singer Kizito Mihigo was found dead in his prison cell, where he had been for three days following his arrest and accusation of crossing the border to Burundi and supposedly fighting in terrorist organizations.² Mihigo, a Tutsi, was 12 when the Rwandan Genocide broke out in 1994. Since his survival, he has been renowned for singing songs about forgiveness and healing. In 2015, the government accused him of engaging in anti-government activity and supposedly planning to assassinate Rwandan president Paul Kagame.³ He was pardoned in 2018. His

-

¹ Ssuuna, Ignatius. "Rwanda Restricts Fasting as 8,000 Churches Closed. *Christianity Today*, 7 August 2018. Available from: https://www.christianitytoday.com/news/2018/august/rwanda-churches-closed-fasting-restricted-rgb-religion-law.html [accessed 17 March 2020]. "More than 8,000 Rwandan Churches Closed Following Government Directive." *World Watch Monitor*, 21 Aug. 2018, www.worldwatchmonitor.org/2018/07/more-than-8000-rwandan-churches-closed-following-government-directive/.

² "Rwanda: Shocking Death of Gospel Singer in Custody Must be Effectively Investigated." *Amnesty International*, 17 February 2020. Available from: https://www.amnesty.org/en/latest/news/2020/02/rwanda-shocking-death-ofgospel-singer-in-custody-must-be-effectively-investigated/ [accessed 17 March 2020].

³ "Rwandan Gospel Singer and Critic of President Dies in Police Cell." *The Guardian*, 17 February 2020. Available from: https://www.theguardian.com/world/2020/feb/17/rwandan-gospel-star-president-critic-kizito-mihigo-diespolice-cell [accessed 17 March 2020].

cause of death was reported to be suicide, although investigations continue.

- 10. At the last periodic review Rwanda supported recommendation 133.1 which promised to continue strengthening its legislation to eliminate all provisions that undermine freedom of expression (Chile) as well as recommendation 134.52, to adopt further measures with the aim of guaranteeing freedom of speech and the independence of the media (Cyprus). Despite this several individuals have been arrested for their speech.
- 11. In October 2019, US Reverend Gregg Schoof, who had been leading an evangelical church and Amazing Grace Christian Radio station in Rwanda. Authorities arrested him for his criticism of the government's actions of closing down churches, as well as allowing birth control and abortion, which he believes to be a rejection and violation of the Gospel.⁴ His arrest displays interference in his freedom of conscience and religion, as well as his freedom of expression. The authorities later deported him after the pastor had been living in Rwanda for over 20 years.
- 12. Deo Nyirigira is a former Rwandan Christian pastor who was exiled. Authorities arrested his daughter Jackie Umuzoha in late November 2019 on "suspicions of treason and espionage." She is still being unlawfully detained and has yet to be formally tried.⁵

Recommendation(s)

Jubilee Campaign urges the Republic of Rwanda to:

- 13. Eliminate all obstacles for faith-based organizations (FBO's) to register legally.
- 14. Cease arbitrarily shutting down churches and other religious organizations.
- 15. Extend the 15-day timeframe for churches to meet the requirements placed by the law.
- 16. Stop arbitrarily arresting Christian leaders on suspicions of conspiracy.

B. Sexual Violence

4 1

⁴ Mureithi, Carlos. "U.S. Pastor Arrested in Rwanda has Criticized Government for 'Heathen Practices.'" *The New York Tines*, 7 October 2019. Available from: https://www.nytimes.com/2019/10/07/world/africa/rwanda-pastor-gregg-schoof-arrested.html [accessed 17 March 2020].

⁵ "Rwanda: Pastor's Daughter Arbitrarily Detained: Jackie Umuhoza." *Amnesty International*, 20 December 2019. Available from: https://www.amnesty.org/en/documents/afr47/1600/2019/en/ [accessed 17 March 2020].

- 16. According to the UN Global Database on Violence against Women, the percentage of Rwandan women who have experienced "lifetime physical and/or sexual intimate partner violence" is 37.1%; the percentage that experienced "physical and/or sexual intimate partner violence in the last 12 months" is 20.7%; and the percentage of girls who were victims of forced child marriage is 6.8%.6
- 17. Although rates of sexual violence have drastically declined since the 1994 Rwandan Genocide tragedy, incidents continue to occur. The only difference is that no longer is rape and sexual violence used as a war tactic, it has become a regular occurrence.⁷
- 18. According to Dr. Daniel Nyamwasa, a Kacyiru neighborhood police commander, "the [UN Population Fund (UNFPA)] centre in Kigali receives between 10 to 12 victims of violence a day. Of those, 28% are survivors of intimate partner violence and the rest have suffered sexual assault."8

Jubilee Campaign urges the Republic of Rwanda to:

- 19. Bring all perpetrators of rape and sexual violence- including those who were active during the 1994 Rwandan Genocide- to justice.
- 20. Condemn all practices of domestic and sexual violence.

C. Human Trafficking and Exploitation

22. The government of Rwanda have been able to rescue several victims of trafficking though they have not reported any convicted traffickers for internal trafficking crimes, despite the presence of sex trafficking and forced labor within the country.⁹

⁶ UN Women Global Database on Violence against Women, *Rwanda*, available at: https://evaw-global-database.unwomen.org/en/countries/africa/rwanda? [accessed 17 March 2020].

⁷ Cousins, Sophie. "I'm Here to Work, Not for Sex': Battling Violence against Women in Rwanda." *The Guardian*, 27 December 2018. Available at: https://www.theguardian.com/global-development/2018/dec/27/battling-violence-against-women-rwanda [accessed 17 March 2020]. ⁸ *ibid*.

⁹ Rwanda National Police. "Clamping down on Human Trafficking in Rwanda." Police.gov.rw, *Rwanda National Police*, available at www.police.gov.rw/media-archives/news-detail/?tx_news_pi1%5Bnews%5D=2857. [accessed 17 March 2020].

- 23. While the government of Rwanda have social service programmes to identify and assist women and children at risk of trafficking, they do not have a systematic or proactive program to identify current victims or a formal mechanism to refer trafficking victims to care. 10
- 24. The International Organization for Migration, along with Never Again Rwanda, revealed that 77.7% of human trafficking victims in Rwanda are female.¹¹ Moreover, the two most prominent forms of trafficking in Rwanda are labor trafficking and sex trafficking. 12

Jubilee Campaign urges the Republic of Rwanda to:

- 25. Take action to combat internal trafficking in addition to transnational trafficking.
- 26. Adopt an updated National Anti-Trafficking in Persons Action Plan.
- 27. Actively prosecute and convict perpetrators of sexual violence and provide treatment and therapy to the victims.
- 28. Create a database of victims and perpetrators before the next reporting period.
- 29. Cooperate with civil society to provide assistance to victims of trafficking.

D. Arbitrary Detention, Enforced Disappearance, Torture

- 29. In 2019, a member of a democratic political oppositional party The United Democratic Forces of Rwanda/FDU-Inkingi, Eugene Ndereyimana, was abducted on his way to a party meeting in mid-July by unknown individuals. The leader of FDU-Inkingi, Victoire Ingabire, has stated that he was abducted by government officials. Ndereyimana had been arrested prior to this incident, in 2018. Ndereyimana is still missing, and his family has been unable to locate him. 13
- 30. Similarly, FDU-Inkingi Vice President Boniface Twagirimana also went missing in 2018 after, according to police officials, he escaped prison.

 10 ibid.

¹¹ "In Rwanda, Research on Understanding Human Trafficking Validated." *International Organization for* Migration, 2 August 2019. Available from: https://www.iom.int/news/rwanda-research-understanding-humantrafficking-validated [accessed 17 March 2020].

¹³ Deutsche Welle. "Rwanda's Disappearing Opposition: DW: 05.08.2019." DW.COM, available at: www.dw.com/en/rwandas-disappearing-opposition/a-49887045. [accessed 18 August 2020].

However, this claim of escape is questionable, as he was held at a maximum-security prison facility. Despite that he is missing, he recently was sentenced to 10 years in prison on charges of "threatening state security." ¹⁴

Recommendation(s)

Jubilee Campaign urges the Republic of Rwanda to:

- 31. Take action against the perpetrators of the enforced disappearances of political opponents.
- 32. Cease the arbitrary detention of political opponents and ensure the enjoyment of due process for all arrested individuals.
- 33. Report to the families, media, and public the whereabouts, health status, and legal status of detained and disappeared individuals.
- 34. Eliminate the practice of placing individuals under arrest without an official warrant and holding detainees for longer than 72 hours, per legal provisions.
- 35. Provide sufficient food and water supplies, as well as improve sanitation and address overcrowding in detention facilities.

IV. Restriction of Political Freedoms

- 39. Articles 34 through 36 of the Constitution of Rwanda grant Rwandan citizensnotably the press- freedom of expression, speech, information, association, and peaceful assembly.
- 40. However, Freedom House gives Rwanda a 23 out of 100 with regards to political freedom.

A. Freedom of Expression/Freedom of Speech

41. There are laws in Rwanda that prohibit disseminating "false information or harmful propaganda with intent to cause public disaffection against the government."¹⁵

¹⁴ Ssuuna, Ignatius. "Missing Rwandan Opposition Politician Sentenced to 10 Years." *The Seattle Times*, 24 January 2020. Available from https://www.seattletimes.com/nation-world/nation/missing-rwandan-opposition-politician-sentenced-to-10-years/ [accessed 17 March 2020].

¹⁵ Ssuuna, Ignatius. "Missing Rwandan Opposition Politician Sentenced to 10 Years." *The Seattle Times*, 24 January 2020. Available from https://www.seattletimes.com/nation-world/nation/missing-rwandan-opposition-politician-sentenced-to-10-years/ [accessed 17 March 2020].

- 42. Since the last Universal Periodic Review of Rwanda the country has received four communications from the Office of the High Commissioner on Human Rights relating to freedom of expression which is an increase from the last period. NGOs have highlighted how the laws restricting freedom of expression in Rwanda extend pass permissible restrictions and violate the international obligations to promote and uphold the right to freedom of speech as enshrined in the African Charter and the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights.¹⁶
- 43. According to Freedom House, because journalists and media reporters face intimidation and threats of arrest from government authorities, self-censorship is often employed by reporters.¹⁷
- 44. On 24th April 2018 Rwanda Utilities Regulatory Authority revoked the radio communication licence of Amazing Grace Radio, saying the the program "followed a pattern of [...] insulting other religious beliefs," and that a radio presenter had on one occasion, "repeatedly insulted women referring to them as evil." According to the radio station their statements were wilfully taken out of context. In addition, the proportionality of closing the whole radio station is called into question.
- 45. In order to escape the censorship and threats of arrest for criticism of the government, many Rwandan reporters have escaped and operated remotely. The Rwandan government, aware of this, has shut down BBC Kinyarwanda, which was the primary BBC network focusing specifically on Rwanda issues.¹⁸

Jubilee Campaign urges the Republic of Rwanda to:

- 46. Stop utilizing laws prohibiting dissemination of false information as a means to arrest individuals with dissenting opinions.
- 47. Stop all practices which discourage political dialogue and discussion.

B. Freedom of Assembly

¹⁶ "Rwanda: Freedom of Expression is under Attack," *Amnesty International*, https://www.amnesty.org/download/Documents/60000/afr470022007en.pdf [accessed 31 August 2020].

¹⁷ "Rwanda." Freedom House, freedomhouse.org/country/rwanda/freedom-net/2019. [accessed 31 August 2020].

¹⁸ Human Rights Watch, *World Report 2019 – Rwanda*, https://www.hrw.org/world-report/2019/country-chapters/rwanda [accessed 17 March 2020].

- 48. Any organizations or individuals who wish to hold or participate in assemblies are required to obtain permission, and even then, they are subject to arrest.¹⁹
- 49. In February 2018, police fired live ammunition into two crowds of Congolese refugees in Karongi town and Kiziba refugee camp who were protesting cuts in assistance. At least 11 people were killed and 20 injured. There has not been an investigation into the police's use of force during the demonstrations, but 65 protesters were arrested and charged with holding an illegal demonstration and violence against the police, among other allegations.²⁰

Jubilee Campaign urges the Republic of Rwanda to:

50. Stop interfering with peaceful assemblies, protests, and demonstrations.

V. Rights of Children

A. Sexual Exploitation

55. According to the most recent Violence Against Children and Youth Survey in Rwanda which was conducted in 2016, 12% of female respondents and 5% of male respondents of the age group 13 to 17 had reported being victims of sexual violence at least a year prior to the survey.²¹

Recommendation(s)

Jubilee Campaign urges the Republic of Rwanda to:

56. Take actions to eliminate sexual exploitation of children.

B. Health and Disease

58. Rwanda's under-five mortality rate is 35.3 per every 1,000 live births.²²

¹⁹ Rwanda" Freedom in the World 2020 Report, *Freedom House*, <u>freedomhouse.org/country/rwanda/freedomworld/2020</u>. [accessed 31 August 2020].

²⁰ Freedom House. Freedom in the World 2020, supra note 18.

²¹ Republic of Rwanda Ministry of Health, *Violence against Children and Youth Survey: Findings from a National Survey, 2015-2016*, https://reliefweb.int/report/rwanda/violence-against-children-and-youth-survey-rwanda-findings-national-survey-2015-2016 [accessed 17 March 2020].

²² UNCIEF Data, Rwanda Country Profile, https://data.unicef.org/country/rwa/ [accessed 17 March 2020].

- 59. Only 56% of births in Rwanda are registered.²³
- 60. In 2018, there were 810 cases of HIV cases among children from ages 0 to 19 years.²⁴
- 61. 37% of Rwandan children experience stunted growth.²⁵

Jubilee Campaign urges the Republic of Rwanda to:

62. Take actions to combat under-five mortality, HIV, stunted growth, and malnutrition in all children.

C. Street Children

- 63. Street children- or vagrant children- who live and perform informal work on the streets, are viewed by the Rwandan government as showing "deviant behaviors," and are often rounded up and kept at Gikondo Transit Center in the capital city Kigali, Rwanda in an attempt to "eradicate delinquency."²⁶
- 64. Although this detention center is legislated to provide vocational education and rehabilitation services, reports reveal that physical abuse, starvation, unsanitary conditions are a reality in this detention center, where these children are held without any formal charges. Some children report that they were restricted from showering more than once a week, and many had had to urinate or defecate themselves when they are denied from accessing the bathrooms at night.²⁷
- 65. According to the National Commission for Children, "44 percent of boys and 36 percent of girls said that they experienced violence at the transit center where they were held."²⁸

²³ *ibid*.

²⁴UNCIEF Data, Rwanda Country Profile, https://data.unicef.org/country/rwa/ [accessed 17 March 2020].

²⁵ ibid.

²⁶ "'As Long as We Live on the Streets, They Will Beat Us': Rwanda's Abusive Detention of Children," *Human Rights Watch*, available from: https://www.hrw.org/report/2020/01/27/long-we-live-streets-they-will-beat-us/rwandas-abusive-detention-children [accessed 17 March 2020]; Uwiringiyimana, Clement. "Rwanda Detaining, Abusing Street Children: Rights Group." *Reuters*, Thomson Reuters, 27 Jan. 2020, www.reuters.com/article/us-rwanda-rights/rwanda-detaining-abusing-street-children-rights-group-idUSKBN1ZQ0PQ.[accessed 31 August 2020].

²⁷ *ibid*.

²⁸ "'As Long as We Live on the Streets, They Will Beat Us': Rwanda's Abusive Detention of Children," *Human Rights Watch*, available from: https://www.hrw.org/report/2020/01/27/long-we-live-streets-they-will-beat-us/rwandas-abusive-detention-children [accessed 17 March 2020].

66. Rates of malaria, rashes, and diarrhea are high at Gikondo.²⁹ The situation in Gitagata Rehabilitation Center is similar.

Recommendation(s)

Jubilee Campaign urges the Republic of Rwanda to:

- 67. Stop detaining street children without cause.
- 68. In the case that street children are arrested, improve the conditions at Gikondo Transit Center and Gitagata Rehabilitation Center by providing sufficient food, water supplies, and bedding, as well as stopping the practice of physical abuse.

VI. **Summary of Recommendations**

Jubilee Campaign urges the Republic of Rwanda to:

- 70. Cease shutting down churches and other religious organizations.
- 71. Stop arbitrarily arresting Christian leaders on suspicions of conspiracy.
- 72. Bring all perpetrators of rape and sexual violence- including those who were active during the 1994 Rwandan Genocide- to justice.
- 73. Adopt an updated National Anti-Trafficking in Persons Action Plan.
- 74. Actively prosecute and convict perpetrators of sexual violence and provide treatment and therapy to the victims.
- 75. Report to the families, media and public the whereabouts, health status, and legal status of detained and disappeared individuals.
- 76. Eliminate the practice of arresting without an official warrant and holding individuals for longer than 72 hours, per legal provisions.
- 77. Cease the practice of utilizing laws prohibiting dissemination of false information as a means to arrest individuals with dissenting opinions and thus infringing upon freedom of expression.
- 78. Stop interfering with peaceful assemblies, protests, and demonstrations.

²⁹ ihid

- 79. Provide extra funding and improve "human resource allocation" to the Ministry of Public Service and Labor.
- 80. Take actions to eliminate sexual exploitation of children.
- 81. Take actions to combat under-five mortality, HIV, stunted growth, and malnutrition in all children.
- 82. In the case that street children are arrested, improve the conditions at Gikondo Transit Center and Gitagata Rehabilitation Center by providing sufficient food, water supplies, and bedding, as well as stopping the practice of physical abuse.