



FINAL ASSESSMENT REPORT ON THE IMPLEMENTATION OF 2015 UPR RECOMMENDATIONS BY THE REPUBLIC OF RWANDA

REPORT COMPILED BY RWANDA CIVIL SOCIETY COALITION ON UPR¹

¹ Rwanda Civil Society Coalition on UPR is made up of: CHRD (Center for Human Rights and Development), CERULAR (Center for Rule of Law Rwanda), FIYO (Fight Illiteracy Youth Organisation), Strive Foundation Rwanda, Rwanda NGO Forum on HIV/AIDS, Never Again Rwanda (NAR), National Union of Disability Organisations of Rwanda (NUDOR), Faith Victory Association (FVA), Hope for Community Development Organisation (HCDO), IMRO (Ithorere Munyarwanda Organisation), LAF (Legal Aid Forum) Secretariat and some members of LAF namely : AJAR (Association des Jeunes Avocats du Rwanda), ADEPE (Action pour le Développement du Peuple), ADL (Association Rwandaise pour la Défense des Droits de la Personne et des Libertés Publiques), AJPRODHO-JJUKIRWA (Association de la Jeunesse pour la Promotion des Droits de l'Homme et du développement), ARDHO (Association Rwandaise pour la Défense des Droits de l'Homme), COPORWA (Communauté des Potiers du Rwanda), HRFRA (Human Rights First Rwanda Association), INALAS (Inara Legal Aid Services), INILAK-LAC (Independent Institute of Lay Adventists of Kigali- Legal Aid Clinic), LIPRODHOR (Ligue Rwandaise pour la Promotion et la Défense des Droits de l'Homme), LOH (The Network of Lawyers of Hope Rwanda), MPEDH (Mouvement des Peuples pour l'Education aux Droits Humains) and NCR (Non Crime Rwanda); Newspaper publications and Media Associations namely; UMUSANZU, IMPAMO, IMANZI, RUGALI, AMAHORU Newspaper, PAX PRESSE, MPH and Media Press House.

JUNE, 2020

**FINAL ASSESSMENT REPORT ON
THE IMPLEMENTATION OF 2015 UPR
RECOMMENDATIONS BY THE REPUBLIC
OF RWANDA**

ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

ADRA	: Adventist Development and Relief Agency
BDF	: Business Development Fund
BK	: Bank of Kigali
CBHI	: Community-Based Health Insurance
CCB I	: Civil Code Book one
CFSVA	: Comprehensive Food Security and Vulnerability Analysis
CIP	: Crop Intensification Program
CCB I	: Civil code book one
CNLG	: Commission Nationale de Lutte contre le Génocide
CRPD	: Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities
CRRF	: Comprehensive Refugee Response Framework
CRC	: Citizen Report Card
CRVS	: Rwanda Civil Registration and Vital Statistics
CSOs	: Civil Society Organisations
DGPR	: Democratic Green Party of Rwanda
DASSO	: District Administration Security Support Organ
DPCs	: District Police Commanders
DNA	: Deoxyribonucleic Acid
DRC	: Democratic Republic of Congo
EAC	: East African Community
EDPRS	: Economic Development and Poverty Reduction Strategy
EICV	: Integrated Household Living Conditions Survey
EMIS	: Education Management Information System
ETM	: Emergency Transit Mechanism
FBOs	: Faith-Based Organisations
GMO	: Gender Monitoring Office

HHs	: Households
HTC	: HIV Testing and Counselling
HIV	: Human Immunodeficiency Virus
HIV/AIDS	: Human Immunodeficiency Viruses/ Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome
HSSP	: Health Sector Strategic Plan
ID	: Identity Card
IECMS	: Integrated Electronic Case Management System
ILO	: International Labour Organisation
IOM	: International Organisation for Migration
LMIS	: Labour Market Information System
LAF	: Legal Aid Forum
LARS	: Learning Achievements in Rwandan school
ICT	: Information Communication Technology
ILPD	: Institute of Legal Practice and Development
LIWOHA	: Life Wounds Healing Association
MDGs	: Millennium Development Goals
MHC	: Media High Council
MIGEPROF	: Ministry of Gender and Family Promotion
MINALOC	: Ministry of Local Government
MINECOFIN	: Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning
MINEDUC	: Ministry of Education
MINEMA	: Ministry in Charge of Emergency Management
MINAGRI	: Ministry of Agriculture and Animal Resources
MIFOTRA	: Ministry of Public Service and Labour
MMI	: Military Medical Insurance
MoH	: Ministry of Health
NWC	: National Women's Council
NYC	: National Youth Council

NECDP	: National Early Childhood Development Program
NSR	: National Rehabilitation Services
NCHR	: National Commission for Human Rights
NEC	: National Electoral Commission
NFPO	: National Forum of Political Organizations
NGOs	: Non-Government Organisations.
NISR	: National Institute of Statistics of Rwanda
NPM	: National Preventive Mechanism
NPPA	: National Public Prosecution Authority
NUDOR	: National Union of Disability Organisations in Rwanda
OG	: Official Gazette
PSF	: Private Sector Federation
PSTA	: Strategic Plan for the Transformation of Agriculture
PWDs	: People with Disabilities
Q	: Quarter
RAMA	: La Rwandaise d'Assurance Maladie
RBA	: Rwanda Bar Association
RCS	: Rwanda Correctional Service
RGB	: Rwanda Governance Board
RGS	: Rwanda Governance Scorecard
RIB	: Rwanda Investigation Bureau
RMC	: Rwanda Media Commission
RURA	: Rwanda Utility and Regulatory Agency
REB	: Rwanda Education Board
RHA	: Rwanda Housing Authority
RMB	: Rwanda Media Barometer
VNR	: Voluntary National Review
SACCO	: Savings and Credit Cooperative Organization

SGBV	: Sexual and Gender Based Violence
SPT	: Subcommittee on Prevention Torture
Sqm	: Square meter
STEM	: Science, Technology Engineering and Mathematics
TIR	: Transparency International Rwanda
TV	: Television
UN	: United Nations
UNHCR	: United Nation High Commission for Refugees
UNICEF	: United Nations Children’s Fund
UNODC	: United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime
UPR	: Universal Periodic Review
USD	: American Dollar
VAT	: Value Added Tax
VUP	: Vision 2020 Umurenge Program
WASH	: Water, Sanitation and Hygiene
WDA	: Workforce Development Authority
WWW	: World Wide Web

CONTENTS

Abbreviations and Acronyms	3
1. Introduction	8
2. General issues underpinning human rights in Rwanda	9
2.1. Legal Framework.....	9
2.2. Policy Framework.....	11
2.3. Institutional Framework.....	14
2.4. Entrenching the culture of human rights respect.....	18
2.5. Cooperation with International mechanisms of human rights and funding Partnerships.....	20
2.6. Protection of human rights Defenders.....	22
2.7. Prevention and punishment of Genocide and strengthening national Unity and Reconciliation.....	23
3. Assessment of specific human rights	25
3.1. Freedom of opinion, expression and access to information.....	25
3.2. Freedom of association and assembly.....	29
3.3. Access to justice, fair trial and due process.....	31
3.4. Humane treatment in detention facilities, prisons, as well as in transit and rehabilitation centers.....	35
3.5. Prevention and punishment of Torture.....	36
3.6. Non-Discrimination and Gender Equality.....	38
3.7. Women emancipation, empowerment and participation.....	42
3.8. Prevention and response to SGBV.....	48
3.9. Human trafficking.....	51
3.10. The right to child registration at birth for all children.....	53
3.11. The right to Education.....	55
3.12. The right to Health.....	59
3.13. The Right to Employment and Decent Working Conditions.....	64
3.14. Right to adequate standard of living and social protection.....	68
3.15. The right to Water and sanitation.....	69
3.16. The right to food.....	71
3.17. The rights of Asylum seekers, refugees and migrants workers.....	72
4. Conclusion	75

1. Introduction

Rwanda's human rights record has been reviewed twice under the Universal Periodic Review mechanism.² The first review was done in 2011 and the second one in 2015. UPR is a unique mechanism. It is the most comprehensive mechanism that assesses state performance on human rights ranging from civil, political, economic, social and cultural rights.

This assessment report, like the mid- term assessment report by the coalition (2018), focuses on the implementation of the recommendations made to Rwanda during the second review on 4th November 2015. In total, 229 recommendations were made.³ Out of the 229 recommendations, 50 enjoyed the support of Rwanda. 103 enjoyed the support of Rwanda but Rwanda considered some to have been implemented or in the process of being implemented while 75 did not enjoy the support of Rwanda and they were thus noted by Rwanda.

The coalition assessed all the recommendations that enjoyed the support of Rwanda, including those that the government considered to have been implemented or in the process of being implemented.

The report is a product of information and data gathered by Coalition members from responsible Government institutions as indicated in the roadmap for UPR implementation, interviews with civil society organizations and literature review from various institutional and country reports.

The coalition is thankful to all institutions and members of CSOs for their cooperation in providing data and information to our UPR research team.

The report is divided into four parts: Part one covers the introduction. Part two concentrates on more general issues that underpin human rights in Rwanda, part three focuses on specific human rights in accordance with the recommendations given to Rwanda in 2015 and part four provides general recommendations.

² UPR was created under resolution 60/251 of the General Assembly of 15 March 2006 and put in place by resolution 5/1 of the UN Human rights Council of 18th June 2007.

³ Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review, Rwanda, A/HRC/31/8.

2. General issues underpinning human rights in Rwanda

2.1. Legal Framework

The Coalition notes with satisfaction that the legal framework guaranteeing the enjoyment of human rights in Rwanda has progressively improved between 2016 until 2019. The Constitution⁴ maintains a chapter on human rights and freedoms. Rwanda is signatory to core UN human rights instruments and several legislations upholding human rights are in place such as children's rights, women's rights, persons with disability rights, access to justice, etc. Between 2016 -2020, a number of laws were either enacted or amended and these include but are not limited to the following:

- The law governing persons and family has been amended twice, in 2016 and 2020 respectively. In addition, the law on succession, matrimonial regimes and liberalities was also revised in 2016. In both cases, the aim was to address gender inequality;
- The law determining offences and penalties (Penal code) has been amended twice, in 2016 and 2018 respectively and a number of provisions that undermine freedom of expression were repealed.
- Law regulating political organizations, one major change ushered in by this reform is that it is no longer compulsory for any political organization to be a member of the National Forum of Political Organizations (NFPO);
- Law determining the mission, organization and functioning of the National Commission for Human Rights incorporating the National Preventive Mechanism (NPM);
- Law relating to the protection of whistle blowers⁵ and modification of the law on corruption revising the 2003 law on prevention, suppression and punishment of corruption and related crimes;⁶
- Enactment of the 2017 law establishing the National Rehabilitation Service (NRS) and determining its mission, organization and functioning⁷ as well as Ministerial Order determining the mission, organization and functioning of transit centres⁸ and three Presidential

4 The Constitution of the Republic of Rwanda of 2003 revised in 2015.

5 Law N° 44bis/2017 of 06/09/2017 relating to the protection of whistle blowers, OG. N° 41 of 9/10/2017

6 Law N° 54/2018 of 13/08/2018 on fighting against corruption, OG Special of 20/09/2018.

7 Law N° 17/2017 of 28/04/2017 establishing the National Rehabilitation Service and determining its mission, organization and functioning, OG No.20 bis of 15/05/2017.

8 Ministerial Order No. 001/07/.01 of 19/04/2018 determining mission, organisation and functioning of transit Centers, OG, .No. Special of 07/06/2018.

Orders establishing Iwawa, Gitagata, Nyamagabe and Rehabilitation centres in order to regulate transit and rehabilitation centres;

- The law determining the jurisdiction of courts was amended in 2018 to create specialised chambers for minors and family at first instance within the intermediate court.
- The law relating to prevention, suppression and punishment of trafficking in persons and other exploitation was enacted in 2018;
- Law N° 66/2018 of 30/08/2018 regulating labour in Rwanda;
- Law N°70/2018 of 31/08/2018 amending Law N°03/2015 of 02/03/2015 governing the organisation of community-based health insurance scheme;
- Law N°71/2018 of 31/08/2018 relating to the protection of the child;
- Law N°72/2018 of 31/08/2018 determining the organisation and functioning of faith-based organisations;
- Rwanda ratified the International Convention on Non-Applicability of Statutory limitations to war crimes and crimes against humanity.

However, the Coalition notes with concern the following

- There is lack of a clear roadmap to accede the following international human rights conventions: International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance, International Labour Organization Domestic Workers Convention, 2011 (N°. 189) and Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on communications procedures.
- There is also concern about Rwanda's withdraw from the voluntary mechanism of submitting individual complaints to the African court on human and peoples' rights;
- Although the GoR has improved on consultations with stakeholders during law making processes, the consultations are still inadequate and sometimes on short notice.

The Coalition thus recommends

- Expedite the process of ratification or accession to the following International Conventions: International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance, the International Labour Organization Domestic Workers Convention, 2011 (N° 189) and the Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on communications procedures;
- Strengthen mechanisms to allow meaningful and effective participation of citizens, civil society and other relevant stakeholders in law reform;
- Re-submit to the voluntary mechanism of allowing filing individual complaints mechanisms before the African Court on Human and Peoples' Rights;
- Increase the capacity of lawyers, judges and prosecutors to invoke human rights conventions duly signed by Rwanda into the day-to-day dispensation of justice.

2.2. Policy Framework

The Coalition commends GoR's efforts to expedite the development and implementation of well-tailored poverty reduction strategies. Sound and comprehensive policies, strategies and action plans aimed at improving the welfare of Rwandans are in place and have yielded tangible results thus far. At the macro-level, the Country's Vision 2020 has been rigorously pursued to the end. A new vision 2050 is in place as well as its halfway vision 2035 all designed to drive Rwanda from a low-income to a middle and upper income country. At the end of a five year EDPRS II in 2016/17, a new 7 Year Government Program, National Strategy for Transformation (NST 1) running from 2017 to 2024 was launched. Rwanda has embarked on the implementation of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) after the successful implementation of the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs).

Several intersectoral policies and strategies are in place across social, economic and governance spheres and have yielded tremendous results to date in relation to improving human development. Key success indicators include; increased life expectancy from 64.5 years in 2015 to 67.8 years in 2020;⁹ people below poverty line reduced from 44.9% in 2011 to 38.1 % in 2018;¹⁰ maternal mortality rate

⁹ <https://www.statistics.gov.rw/publication/life-expectancy-birth>.

¹⁰ MINECOFIN, Key Statistics on Rwanda, December 2019, p. 22.

decreased from 476/100,000 in 2015 to 248 deaths per 100,000 live births in 2017.¹¹ From 2010 to date, infant mortality rate dropped from 50/1000 LB to 32/1000 LB and child mortality rate decreased from 76/1000 LB to 50/1000 LB.¹²

There has been an increased enrollment of students in secondary schools from 592,501 students in 2017 to 652,944 students in 2018;¹³ there was a 7% increase in enrollment in public health insurance from 76.3% in 2014/15 to 84.6% in 2017/18.¹⁴

In 2018 Rwanda stabilized gender disparities in education with girls' enrolment at 49.7 % and 53.2 % in primary and secondary levels respectively, while that of tertiary education was estimated at 42.6%.¹⁵

However, the Coalition notes with concern the following

- Despite solid economic performance averaging 6.1% over 2013-2016, it still fell short of the target of 11.5% over the period 2013-2020.¹⁶ Furthermore, despite growth in all sectors a number of human development indicators still remain low. For example, according to EICV5 survey (2016/17), 38.2% of the population was poor and 16.0% lived in extreme poverty, showing a very modest (less than 1 %) reduction in poverty levels compared to EICV4 survey (2013/14) where poverty stood at 39.1% and extreme poverty at 16.3%. In addition, despite impressive gains made in high numbers of children enrolling into school, the quality of education remained low, estimated at 53.6%.¹⁷ Similarly in the health sector, the number of qualified medical doctors per 100,000 habitants remain low at 1/8,919.¹⁸
- The Coalition further notes that other challenges associated with the policy framework include; inadequate monitoring and evaluation mechanisms to ensure that policies in place maximize their intended impact, for example, the National Legal Aid Policy (2014).¹⁹

11 https://www.who.int/gho/maternal_health/countries/rwa.pdf?ua=1 visited on 12th June 2020.

12 Idem.

13 Stefan Trines, Rising from the Ashes of Genocide: Rwanda in the 21st Century, Education in Rwanda, October 15, 2019 on <https://wenr.wes.org/2019/10/education-in-rwanda> visited on 12th June 2020.

14 Management Science for work, Removing Hardship to Increase Access to and Promote Preventive Health Services, May 09, 2019 on <https://www.msh.org/news-events/stories/removing-financial-hardship-to-increase-access-to-and-promote-preventive-health> visited on 12th June 2020.

15 MINECOFIN, 2019 Rwanda Voluntary National Review (VNR) Report on the implementation of SDGs, p.23.

16 MINECOFIN, 7 Years Government Programme: National Strategy for Transformation (NST1) 2017–2024, ON http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/National_Strategy_For_Transformation_-_NST1.pdf visited on 12th June 2020.

17 RGB, RGB 6th Edition, The state of Governance in Rwanda, 2019, p. 31.

18 MoH, Health labor Market Analysis Report, 2019, on http://www.moh.gov.rw/fileadmin/user_upload/Publication/Rwanda_HLMA_Report.pdf visited on 12th June 2020.

19 See LAF, Assessment of the Implementation of the National Legal Aid Policy (2020).

- Most of the policies are enacted but are always affected by budget constraints to enable their full implementation. One case in a point is the delayed establishment of the legal aid fund explicitly provided for under the legal aid policy.²⁰
- Another challenge observed by the Coalition is that the policy design predominantly pursues a more top-down style of policy preparation and implementation with little time for consultation with citizens, civil society and other relevant stakeholders. Despite improvement in the level of citizen's participation in policy formulation from 61.93% in 2016 to 72.6% in 2019,²¹ the level of citizen's participation still calls for improvement.
- There is still a challenge of full gender mainstreaming, integration and inclusion of all persons especially the most vulnerable and disadvantaged persons such as persons with disabilities, historically marginalized groups and other groups suffering from intersectional vulnerabilities. For example, it was pointed out that there are no specific indicators to measure inclusion of PWDs in a number of government programs such as VUP, one cow per family, consequently making PWDs not benefit from such development programs.²²

The Coalition thus recommends

- Further intensify efforts to expedite development through the designed poverty reduction strategies;
- Improve gender mainstreaming, integration and inclusion of vulnerable and marginalized groups with clear disaggregated indicators;
- Increase citizen's participation and other relevant stakeholders such as CSOs in the design, implementation and monitoring of different Government policies. In particular, strengthen community forums such as Community service work (*Umuganda*), Parents evening forums (*Umugoroba w'ababyeyi*) and Citizen's Assemblies (*Intekoz'Abaturage*) and harness the use of ICT Platforms to timely provide real information to the citizens and collect their views about upcoming policies and existing policies;

²⁰ Idem.

²¹ See RGB, RGS, The State of Governance in Rwanda 2016 and 2019.

²² NUDOR, Alternative Report on the Implementation of CRPD, (2018), file:///C:/Users/User/Downloads/Rwanda-alternative-report-on-the-implementation-of-the-CRPD-Final-Signed-by-NUDOR%20(3).pdf

- Strengthen monitoring systems for different government policies, strategies and action plans for adequate implementation and expected results;
- Allocate a sufficient budget to support financial, human and technical resources to fully implement adopted policies and their implementation plans in order to maximize desired impact.

2.3. Institutional Framework

The Coalition noted that there exists a solid institutional architecture that supports the promotion and protection of human rights. The Constitution provides for the following constitutional bodies in charge of promotion and protection of human rights: the National Commission for Human Rights, the Office of the Ombudsman, Gender Monitoring Office, and the Rwanda Governance Board among others.

It also provides for specialized commissions in charge of promoting special interest groups namely: the National Youth Council, the National Commission for Children, the National Women's Council and the Council of persons with disabilities. The Judiciary is constitutionally mandated as the guarantor of human rights.

2.3.1. National Commission for Human Rights

Rwanda received and accepted two recommendations regarding strengthening the performance of the Commission. To this effect, the Coalition appreciates the following initiatives undertaken to strengthen the Commission:

- The National Preventive Mechanism was included under Article 7 *bis* of the revised Law N° 61/2018 of 24/08/2018 modifying Law N° 19/2013 of 25/3/2013 determining missions, organisation and functioning of the NCHR setting the Commission as a National Preventive Mechanism (NPM) with powers as regards to the prevention and punishment of torture and other cruel, inhumane or degrading treatment or punishment.
- In line with the new mandate, NCHR commissioners and staff were trained on the new mandate of NPM and how to carry out investigations on torture related matters and different staff of NCHR continued to receive capacity building trainings.²³

²³ Interview Notes with NCHR.

- Different mechanisms have been put in place to increase the Commission's outreach such as public hearing events conducted every two weeks, use of toll free line, weekly radio emissions, focal points to gather information at the level of administrative sector, assigning 5 districts to each of the commissioners for coordination, supported by two technical staff, etc.
- The Commission continued to receive and investigate cases of human rights abuse. From 2017 - 2019, the NCHR received a total of 2,769 complaints of human rights violations of which 1,777 representing 64, 2% were successfully solved.²⁴
- The Commission continued with human rights awareness raising campaigns. From 2017 to 2019, the NCHR sensitized a total of 322,348 persons on different human rights issues.²⁵

However, the Coalition notes with concern the following

- The NCHR's budget allocated to capacity building continued to decline in the last two years. It drastically decreased from 36,522,350 RWF in the financial year 2017-2018 to 8,356,500 RWF during the financial year 2018-2019.²⁶This comes amidst the increased need for capacity building owing to an evolving new mandate of NCHR since the 2013 reforms;
- Since it was designated as the NPM in 2018, the NCHR has never published its annual report(s) on torture as required under NPM guidelines;
- Under its mandate to litigate on behalf of citizens in case of human rights abuses, the NCHR has no clear statistics of cases litigated thus far and such mandate excludes litigation in criminal matters. According to Article 9 of 2013 law regulating the mission, organization and functioning of the NCHR, the Commission only litigates on behalf of citizens in cases involving human rights violations related to civil, commercial, labor and administrative. Moreover, data is not clearly disaggregated in the Commission's annual reports;
- The decisions of the Commission are not fully enforceable by law. Consequently, out of 2,769 complaints over human rights violations

²⁴ NCHR Annual Reports (2017/18 & 2018/19).

²⁶ NCHR Annual Reports (2017/18 & 2018/19).

handled from 2017 to 2019, only 1,777 representing 64, 2% were successfully solved;

- The Commission is very centralized and has no physical presence at grass roots level and this can impede its ability to be seized by victims of human rights violations.

The Coalition thus recommends

- The NCHR should publish annually cases of torture it investigated and those litigated on behalf of citizens as well as the outcome of the Commission's interventions;
- The Government should proportionately increase the budget allocated to capacity building for NCHR's Staff;
- Modify the NCHR law to include criminal cases among cases the Commission can file legal actions on behalf of citizens beyond civil, commercial, labor and administrative matters. In addition, empower NCHR with enforcement powers to ensure that its decisions are binding.
- If possible, the commission have permanent staff at district level who can help increase its outreach especially in hard to reach areas in order to reach out to potential victims of human rights abuses.

2.3.2. Office of the Ombudsman

Rwanda received and accepted one recommendation regarding strengthening the capacity of the Office of the Ombudsman. The Coalition commends different reforms undertaken since the last review to strengthen the institutional framework and capacity of the office of the Ombudsman namely:

- Review of the organizational structure of the Office of Ombudsman to equip it with sufficient personnel in order to respond effectively to its mandate. The office was authorized to recruit on a contractual basis three additional staff in order to clear up the backlog of cases seeking a review by the Supreme Court. Consequently, as of February 2020, there were no remaining of backlogs;²⁷
- Law N° 30/2018 of 02/06/2018 determining the jurisdiction of courts which reduced the number of cases to be reviewed on the grounds of injustice. Article 54 of the new law allows petitioning of the office of

²⁷ Interview notes with the Office of the Ombudsman.

the Ombudsman on grounds of injustice as a matter of appeal other than first instance as it was the case before;

- Adoption of Law N°54/2018 of 13/08/2018 on punishment of corruption (modifying the 2003 law on corruption) introducing a progressive definition of the crime of corruption in line with the United Nations Convention against Corruption. In addition, Law N° 44bis/2017 of 06/09/2017 relating to the protection of whistle blowers was adopted;
- The Office of the Ombudsman conducted different trainings for its staff on investigation of corruption and other forms of injustices. According to 2016-2017 Annual report, different members of staff of the Ombudsman were trained on the following subjects: economic and financial crimes, public procurement, managing exhibits and proceeds on crimes, legal practice, high end investigation and forensic sciences, etc. In April 2018, one employee was trained in Mauritius, in May 2019 and August 2018; 2 employees were also trained in South Africa twice. In February 2019, two Staffs were trained on investigation techniques on financial crimes and 29 staffs were trained on investigation techniques on evidences collection on corruption crimes.
- In partnership with the European Union, a total of 41 staff were trained on different capacity building techniques during December 2019 and January 2020.
- From 2016 to 2017, a total of 226 cases involving different forms of injustices and 82 cases involving corruption were investigated by the Office of the Ombudsman.²⁸ From 2018-2019, a total number of 1,091 cases were analyzed, and 96 of them were transferred to the Supreme Court for review while 995 cases were declared as not linked to injustice.²⁹

The Coalition thus

- Notes with satisfaction the level of efforts by the Office of the Ombudsman to implement the recommendation given to it and requests the office to continue in that direction.

²⁸ Ombudsman Annual Report, 2016-2017, p.60.

²⁹ Ombudsman Annual Report, 2018-2019, p.4.

2.3.3. Treaty body Reporting Mechanism

Rwanda received and accepted one recommendation regarding establishment of a national system for monitoring international human rights recommendations. To this effect, the Coalition commends:

- The political will demonstrated by GoR in enacting a legal instrument establishing the National Treaty Body Reporting Mechanism. Under the new MINIJUST Strategic Plan (2019-2024), a commitment has been made that a permanent National Treaty Body Reporting mechanism will be established through a Ministerial Order;
- There is an *ad hoc* Task Force established since 2006 which is composed by 36 different institutions from Government agencies and CSOs. The Task Force plays a key role in providing information and preparing draft reports. The Task Force also played a crucial role in the design of the implementation Road Map of UPR recommendations.

The Coalition recommends

- Expedite the process of enacting an order establishing the national treaty body monitoring and reporting mechanism.

2.4. Entrenching the culture of human rights respect

Rwanda received and accepted in total eleven recommendations in relation to entrenching the culture of human rights respect. Seven recommendations were received and accepted on the adoption of a national human rights action plan. Two recommendations were received and accepted on mainstreaming of the human rights in school curricula. Two recommendations were accepted on compulsory human rights training of administrative officials and law enforcement personnel and mainstreaming human rights in the curriculum for different law enforcement agents.

The Coalition commends positive steps taken to deepen the culture of human rights respect and these include:

- The National Human Rights Action Plan was adopted and approved by the Cabinet in February 2017. Following its adoption, it was disseminated to relevant stakeholders through dissemination workshops, posting on the MINIJUST and NCHR websites, etc.

- Human rights has been mainstreamed in 2015 school competence based curriculum specifically in social studies in primary and in general paper and communication in secondary schools.³⁰
- Human rights subjects have been mainstreamed in various training manuals for different law enforcement agents. For example, in the RCS Training Manual, Human Rights is integrated in compliance with international standards and it is taught to all staff at all levels.³¹ The Rwanda Investigation Bureau (RIB) has a module called “Human Rights in Criminal Investigation and Professional Ethics” which takes 3 days to be fully taught.³² The Rwanda National Police (RNP) has included modules on human rights and the respect for due process in every training conducted for Police Basic Course, Cadet Course, career and professional courses.³³
- In partnership with NCHR and different human rights organisations, human rights clubs have been formed across schools.
- Different human rights education campaigns were conducted targeting different groups of rights holders such as students, prisoners, women, youth etc, through different methods such as public sensitization, use of ICT (for example LAF’s mobile phone by dialing *845# platform), radio, posters, etc. Topics covered include rights of persons under detention, procedural law, land and expropriation, gender based violence and child rights law, succession; family and Jurisdiction of courts, Abunzi Committee law, etc. ³⁴

However, the Coalition notes with concern the following gaps

- There is inadequate coordination of human rights awareness campaigns between NCHR and various human rights CSOs targeting specifically duty bearers;
- Simplified manuals on human rights for children in schools are still missing despite the commitment to have produced them by end of 2018 as outlined in the implementation roadmap;
- Human rights based approaches have not been clearly entrenched in all sectors.

³⁰ Interview notes with Rwanda Education Board (REB).

³¹ Interview notes with Rwanda Correction Services (RCS).

³² Interview notes with Rwanda Investigation Bureau (RIB).

³³ Interview notes with Rwanda National Police (RNP).

³⁴ Reports from Human rights CSOs such as LAF, CLADHO, RBA, RBJ, HAGURUKA etc.

The Coalition thus recommends

- Expedite the production and dissemination of a simplified manuals on human rights to schools and learning institutions to catchup on the roadmap;
- Continue rolling out coordinated national wide human rights awareness campaigns targeting all relevant rights' holders and duty bearers in partnership with NCHR and different human rights CSOs;
- Continue regular refresher courses on human rights targeting different law enforcement agents including officers from RNP, RIB, RCS and conduct intensive human rights education campaigns targeting para security corps such as District Administration Security Support Organ (DASSO) and community security patrols agents;
- Strengthen human rights based approach mainstreaming in all sectors.

2.5. Cooperation with International Mechanisms of Human Rights and Funding Partnerships

Rwanda received and accepted three recommendations in relation to strengthening cooperation with international mechanisms of human rights as well as mobilization of resources to fulfill its human rights obligations. In addition, three recommendations enjoyed the support of Rwanda and were considered as implemented or under implementation while seven recommendations did not enjoy the support of Rwanda.

The Coalition commends the following

- Rwanda complies with treaty body reporting obligations in accordance with respective reporting cycles;
- Rwanda's standing invitation to all special procedure mandate holders is still valid;
- Rwanda received a delegation from the Sub-Committee on Torture (SPT) in October 2017;
- NCHR has a long standing partnership agreement with UNDP on promotion of human rights;
- The Office of the Ombudsman has a running agreement with EU delegation in Rwanda in relation to investigation and prosecution

of corruption and to make the right to information a reality for all Rwandan;

- In 2016, the OHCHR in Rwanda supported the GoR in capacity building of judges on the applicability of international laws in domestic courts;
- U.S. Department of State through IOM supported GoR to organize trainings of partners in human trafficking;
- A training of trainer's workshop was organized by UNODC, IOM & MINIJUST in December 2017;
- MINIJUST also benefits from support from One UN to promote access to justice and fulfill human rights obligations.

However, the Coalition has the following concerns

- Insufficient cooperation with the mission of SPT which culminated into an abrupt suspension of their mission before its completion citing "obstruction" reasons.³⁵
- There is also a concern about Rwanda's withdrawal from the voluntary mechanism of submitting individual and NGOs' human rights complaints directly to the African Court on Human and People's Rights under article 34(6).³⁶
- Insufficient financial resources earmarked for human rights monitoring and education available for access by civil society organizations.

Thus the Coalition recommends

- Re-commit to the mechanism of the African Court on human and people's rights regarding individual complaints;
- Initiate dialogue between GoR and SPT to renew and complete the mission of the latter in Rwanda;
- Increase resources for human rights education, mainstreaming and monitoring.

³⁵ See MINIJUST Press release on the termination of SPT mission, www.minijust.gov.rw/media/news/newsdetails/?L=%2Fproc%27A%3D0&tx.

See also the <http://www.rw.one.un.org/press-center/press-release/preventionortorture-un-human-rights-body-suspends-rwanda-visit-citing-for-the-causes-of-termination-of-the-mission-by-spt>.

³⁶ <http://www.minijust.gov.rw/media/press-releases/?L=%2Fproc%2Fself%2F>, See also, Why Rwanda withdrew from the African Court Declaration, www.newtimes.co.rw/section/read/197697.

2.6. Protection of Human Rights Defenders

In relation to protection of human right defenders, Rwanda received and accepted one recommendation and incorporated it into its roadmap. Besides, one recommendation enjoyed the support but was considered to be implemented or in the process of being implemented and four recommendations did not enjoy the support of Rwanda.

The coalition commends the Government of Rwanda for the following initiatives in relation to protection of human rights:

- The 2003 Constitution as revised in 2015 provides a solid basis for human rights protection for every one including human rights defenders. Specific provisions include the establishment of independent oversight human rights institutions such as NCHR and the Office of the Ombudsman;
- Other progressive reforms adopted include adoption of the Law N° 44bis/2017 of 06/09/2017 protecting whistle-blowers that has been enacted in 2017, the amendment of the law on jurisdiction of courts in 2018 to allow increased use of public interest litigation and *amicus curiae* by human rights defenders as a tool for judicial advocacy, decriminalization of defamation in the 2018 and 2020 reforms of law determining offences and penalties;
- Human rights defenders are recognized as government stakeholders in the current National Human Rights Action Plan 2018-2024;
- There is standing invitation to all special rapporteurs including special rapporteur on the situation of human rights defenders.

However, the Coalition has the following concerns

- There is no comprehensive policy or a law to protect human rights defenders in their diversity, during their daily work of investigating and denouncing human rights abuses;

Thus, the Coalition recommends

- Consider the protection of human rights defenders by establishing a stand-alone policy and law on the protection of human rights defenders.

2.7. Prevention and Punishment of Genocide and Strengthening National Unity and Reconciliation

Rwanda received and accepted three recommendations, which were incorporated in its roadmap of implementation of the recommendations. Two recommendations enjoyed the support but were considered to be implemented or in the process of being implemented. The coalition commends the Government of Rwanda for the following initiatives:

- Measures to prevent denial and revisionism of Genocide against the Tutsi through trial and punishment of perpetrators have continued. From July 2016 to June 2017, a total of 72 genocide denial cases were denounced. Among them, 40 were filed to courts and 29 were closed. From July 2016 to June 2017, the total of 319 genocide ideology cases were identified. Among them, 208 cases were filed to courts while 106 were closed. From the year 2017-2018, around 822 cases were lodged and 660 decided. Finally, during the year 2018-2019, about 802 cases were lodged and 614 cases were decided.³⁷
- Legal reforms were implemented including adoption of Law N° 59/2018 of 22/8/2018 on prevention and punishment of genocide ideology which improved clarity in the definition of the crime of genocide ideology. Furthermore, a Presidential Order N° 03/01 of 19/01/2015 determining the modalities for monitoring and conducting thorough investigation of the acts hindering unity and reconciliation was adopted in order to monitor any form of discrimination and conflicts;
- Various civic education campaigns were undertaken by both state and non-state actors to prevent genocide ideology. In addition, sensitization campaigns of promotion of national unity and reconciliation specifically targeting youth, teachers, prisoners, parents and the general population at large have been undertaken. For example, the National Commission for the Fight Against Genocide (CNLG) conducted anti-genocide awareness campaign and sessions on genocide prevention through Ndi Umunyarwanda, Itorero Program in different fora as follows: 50 public lectures in prisons, 133 during solidarity camps (*Ingando*), 28 in transit centres, 395 through Radio & Televisions shows, 14 through community groups and 963 in secondary and institutions of higher learning. In 2019, about 1623 high school teachers of History courses received trainings on Rwandan history;

³⁷ Annual reports from CNLG.

- The National Commission for Unity and Reconciliation (NURC) undertook further interventions in prevention of genocide and promotion of national unity and reconciliation, specifically through the following: *Ndi Umunyarwanda (Rwandaness)* campaigns, Identification and recognition of *Abarinzi b'igihango* (Rwandans and non-Rwandans with outstanding actions portraying unity and Rwandan identity); Social hearing initiatives were conducted for survivors of the Genocide against the Tutsi, families of genocide perpetrators, genocide inmates and convicted genocide perpetrators as well as promotion of critical thinking among the young generation;
- With regard to the assistance of victims of genocide in restoring their rights, a total of 44,025 Gacaca judgments were executed;
- Consequently, Rwanda Reconciliation Barometer published by NURC in 2016 has shown that 92.5% of Rwandans today feel that unity and reconciliation has been achieved and that citizens live harmoniously together and feel more unified. According to RGB's Rwanda Governance Scorecard (RGS) published in 2019, reconciliation, social cohesion and unity attained 93.99% which shows that Rwanda continues to achieve progress in that field.

However, the following issues need urgent attention

- There is still a gap in reaching out to parents who are cited as often propagating divisionism, genocide ideology among children and the youth in home settings;
- There is another challenge of curbing against propagation of genocide ideology through mainstream and social media especially propagated by genocide deniers in foreign countries;³⁸
- There is a real need to take important measures of maintaining social cohesion, community reintegration, unity and reconciliation given that there will be release of a big number of former genocide perpetrators who have served their prison sentences, some of them for more than 20 years;
- Despite progress made in enforcement of judgments rendered by Gacaca Courts in favor of Genocide victims, there were 34,845 cases of Gacaca judgments that remained unenforced by the end 2018/2019.³⁹

³⁸ See <https://www.rba.co.rw/post/Senate-to-disseminate-research-findings-on-Genocide-denial-in-diaspora-across-the-country>.

³⁹ MINIJUST Annual Report, 2018/2019 p.27.

Thus the Coalition recommends

- Intensify programs on civic education specifically focusing on promoting the common identity of Rwandans (*Ndi Umunyarwanda*), genocide prevention and specifically target different special groups separately including children, youth, teachers, parents, local leaders, opinion leaders, religious and business community etc;
- Strengthen measures to promote critical thinking among young generation.
- Strengthen measures to ensure smooth reintegration of released genocide convicts through targeted interventions before and after release;
- Strengthen prosecution of persons charged with divisionism, incitement to commit genocide, genocide ideology and where possible, conduct trials and sentencing publically at the scene of the crime in order to serve as a deterrent;
- Enforce all pending Gacaca judgments as soon as possible.

3. Assessment of specific human rights

3.1. Freedom of Opinion, Expression and Access to Information

In relation to freedom of opinion, expression and access to information, Rwanda received and accepted one recommendations and incorporated them into the UPR implementation roadmap. In addition, five recommendations enjoyed the support of Rwanda but were considered to be implemented or in the process of being implemented, and thirteen recommendations did not enjoy the support of Rwanda and were thus noted. The coalition commends the following:

- Rwanda implemented extensive media reforms in the past years aimed at guaranteeing freedom of opinion, expression and access to information. Consequently positive results include increased quality of media reporting up to 98 % and media public confidence in up to 75%⁴⁰ while media availability and access to information for citizens attained 76.6% of citizens' appreciation according to RGS published in 2019;

⁴⁰ RGB, Rwanda Media Barometer (RMB), 2018.

- New Law n° 69/2019 of 8/11/2019 amending law n°. 68/2018 of 30/08/2018 determining offences and penalties in general (Penal Code) repealed some articles which decriminalized defamation such as Art. 154 related to public defamation, Art. 233 related to humiliation of authorities, Art. 236 related to insults and defamation against the President of the Republic;
- 172 journalists were trained by RGB on access to information law and 351 people from different categories from 10 Districts were trained on access to information law;
- Awareness campaigns on the law on access to information were conducted by RGB in all the 30 Districts of Rwanda through community radio programs;
- Protection of source of information for journalists has improved. No case of confiscation of equipment of journalists was reported during the fiscal year 2018-2019 compared to 7 cases recorded in 2017-2018;
- Dialogue between RNP and different media stakeholders including RGB, MHC, RMC, ARJ and journalists is held every two months with the aim to streamlining collaboration, information sharing and refreshment on existing laws and ethics. Consequently, safety of journalists improved from 70.6% in 2016 to 73.8% in 2018 (RMB 2018);
- The performance of the Office of the Ombudsman in enforcing cases related to access to information law improved during 2018-2019. For example, out of 30 cases of denial of information reported to the Office of the Ombudsman by journalists, 28 representing 93.3% received satisfactory responses. In addition, the Office of the Ombudsman requested and ensured that official spokespersons for public institutions were appointed and their contact information such as their names, telephone numbers and email addresses are publically availed. This was revealed during an Interview with the Office of the Ombudsman;
- Out of 1,066 journalists operating in Rwanda, over 1,000 registered with RMC representing 93.8% were trained by HMC to increase their skills, on the code of ethics of media practitioners, media management, investigative journalism, access to information law etc.

However, the Coalition would like to point out the following

- Article 157 the same law (publication of edited statements or images) on the issue of editing poses problem because it is hard to avoid editing statement or photos when you are a journalist;
- The right to information declined from 85.2% in 2016 to 73.2% in 2018. Specifically, the journalists' ranking of their right to information registered as low as 63.1%. (Rwanda Media Barometer/RMB 2018);
- Outdated and inadequate media policy adopted in 2011, which does not respond to current challenges of the media sector such as funding, regulation of online media etc. Conversely, the media sector is becoming wide and complex with no line ministry to provide strategic policy direction;
- Absence of a legal instrument regulating RMC which consequently weakens its capacity, liberty and independence to perform its mandate and mission of media-self regulation;
- High transaction costs of operating radio and TV stations due to monopoly of few operators offered license by RURA to operate radio antennae leading to unregulated and high communication charges. For example, connection to one radio frequency costs 2,140 USD per year (RURA Law 2013). Connection to TV channels costs between 1,000 to 2,000 USD per month;⁴¹
- Absence of clarity and segregation of duties among current media regulators namely RGB, RURA, RMC, HMC leading to duplication and conflicts of interests;
- Absence of regulatory framework for mushrooming online media publications especially web-based TVs. Since you tubers and bloggers are not coordinated and given that the only way they get money is from their posts, views and likes, they sometimes act as if everything is permitted and post contents violates media ethics and committing crimes that otherwise would be avoided. Lack of regulation is therefore becoming a serious concern. Youtubers and bloggers should be considered as media practitioners and therefore regulated;
- Limited access to information for PWDs for example those with visual and hearing impairments as well as hearing and death impairments.

⁴¹ Interview notes with the Chief Editor of Family TV.

Currently, there is no private broadcaster offering sign language simultaneous translation. Public documents and websites are not accessible in braille formats.

- Rwanda is not signatory to the Marrakech Treaty on PWD that is intended to help the visually impaired access copies of printed materials by allowing “authorized entities” to create accessible versions of them without having to seek the prior agreement of, or paying a royalty to the copyright owner.⁴²

Thus, the Coalition recommends

- Repeal Article 157 of the Penal Code (publication of edited statements or images) on the issue of editing because it is hard to avoid editing statement or photos;
- Enact an updated media policy after a thorough consultation with all relevant media stakeholders;
- Regulate media through a comprehensive policy and institutional framework in particular regulation of online media;
- Establish the legal instrument guaranteeing full autonomy of RMC as a media self-regulatory body;
- Lower transaction costs through regulation by RURA;
- Increase access to information for PWDs through increased use of braille and sign language in dissemination of public information and documents;
- Regulate, harmonize and lower communication fees on radio antennae by RURA. Lower subscription fees for TV antennae by local TV stations;
- Put in place a one centralized mechanism of media development and clarify duties of media regulation organs (MHC, RURA, RGB, RMC) to avoid duplication and conflict of interests;
- Establishment of a basket fund to offer financial support to media;
- Intensify sensitization campaigns on the right to access to information targeting both rights holders and duty bearers;

⁴² <https://www.lexology.com/library/detail.aspx?g=124b50b6-baf0-41d2-bb43-389f02e84c83> accessed on 17th June 2020.

- Intensify capacity building programs aimed at strengthening media professionalism.
- Ratification of the Marrakech Treaty on PWD

3.2. Freedom of Association and Assembly

Rwanda received and accepted one recommendation and incorporated it into its roadmap. In addition, eleven recommendations enjoyed the support of Rwanda but were considered to be implemented or in the process of being implemented. The Coalition would like to commend positive steps implemented thus far to improve the enjoyment of the right to freedom of association and assembly:

- Law on political parties was modified.⁴³ Key improvements in the law are: Article 50 makes it optional rather than mandatory for a registered political organization to be a member of the NFPO in Rwanda; Article 11 reduces the number of required founding members of political organization from 600 to 200 country wide;
- A new law regulating Faith-Based Organisations (FBOs) was adopted.⁴⁴ Key improvements in the law are: For example, to be elected as a legal representative of a FBO, Article 20 provides for mandatory possession of a bachelor's degree in religious studies or any bachelor's degree with a valid certificate in religious studies related matters issued by a recognised institution. Articles 29(3) provides for stronger mechanisms to prevent and resolve conflicts among member organisations or umbrellas as one of the key responsibilities assigned to the newly established layer of umbrella and a forum of umbrellas;
- Draft law regulating national NGOs is underway and the coalition applauds the initiative by RGB to consult stakeholders in the process of drafting the law.

However the Coalition would like to point out the following issues

- The implementation of Article 8 of the law governing political organisations related to convening meetings preparing or deciding on the establishment of a political organisation raises ambiguity between notification and request for permission.

⁴³ See Organic Law No 005/2018 of 30/08/2018 Modifying Organic Law No 10/2013 of 11/07/2013 governing Political Organisations and Politicians, OG. No 38 of 17/09/2018.

⁴⁴ Law No72/2018 of 31/08/2018 Law determining the organization and functioning of faith based organisations.

- Consequently, new political organisations have found it practically difficult to convene constitutive meetings;⁴⁵
- Closure of faith based organisations for non-compliance with high construction standards which are hard to comply with. In accordance with Ministerial Order N°04/Cab.M/015 of 18/05/2015 determining Urban Planning and Building Regulations, complex conditions are fixed for faith-based organizations for them to operate such as 0.5 ha space, parking space, health facilities and soundproof systems. As a consequence, over 2,117 churches were closed down and only 786 representing 31.1% reopened by end of 2018;⁴⁶
- Article 4 of the law regulating faith based organisations gives RGB powers to carry out financial and assets audit of any organisation, umbrella, and forum of umbrellas or ministry when considered necessary. Further, Article 37 grants RGB unilateral powers to suspend or dismiss one or many of its members of administration in case its organs fail to take actions. Both articles may give room for interference with the internal management of faith based organisations hence undermining their independence and freedom of association;
- Unfair legal provisions in the law regulating national non-governmental. For example, article 38 of the Law N°04/2012 of 17/02/2012 which requires NGOs to inform administrative authorities and security organs if debates are anticipated in the general assembly meetings. Article 30 of the Law N°04/2012 of 17/02/2012 governing the organization and the functioning of national non-governmental organizations that gives broad mandate to RGB to monitor the activities of NGOs which has sometimes led to undue interference in the functioning of NGOs. Complex and lengthy registration procedures of civil society organizations and international organizations.
- The Coalition is particularly concerned with the practice requiring prospective NGOs to secure recommendation letters from Districts where they intend to carry out their activities, MoUs with line Ministries or Government Institutions, as a registration requirements. The Coalition is of the view that such requirements are challenging to secure for an organization, which has not yet started operations hence this can preclude the NGO from being registered.

⁴⁵ Interview Notes with President of DGPR.

⁴⁶ LIPRODHOR, Assessment of the respect of the right to pray and freedom of religious organizations in Rwanda (2018).

Thus the Coalition recommends

- Expedite the modification of the existing law regulating National NGOs specifically repealing articles 17 and 38 and offer autonomy to national NGOs in governing their internal matters to the extent possible;
- Repeal articles 4 and 37 of the law regulating faith based organizations to give them full autonomy to regulate their internal affairs without intervention of RGB;
- Lower the minimum construction requirements for churches to start their operations;
- Clarify under the law the minimum guidelines for convening a constitutive meeting of a political organisations.

3.3. Access to Justice, Fair Trial and Due Process

Rwanda received and accepted four recommendations and incorporated them into its roadmap. Four recommendations enjoyed the support of Rwanda but were considered to be implemented or in the process of being implemented and eleven recommendations did not enjoy the support of Rwanda and were thus noted. The Coalition would like to commend positive steps taken thus far to improve the enjoyment of the right to access to justice, fair trial and due process:

- Existing and new legislations guaranteeing access to justice for vulnerable persons were continued to be implemented. Specifically, mandatory legal aid for minors in conflict with the law continued to be guaranteed by law. In addition legal representation for all persons appearing before the Supreme Court and the newly created Court of Appeal is mandatory by law. Court fees are waived off for poor persons in possession of a certificate of indigence issued by local authorities in line with article 3 of the Ministerial Order N°133/MOJ/AG/18 of 04/06/2018 on court fees in civil, commercial, social and administrative matters;
- Through different institutional arrangements by both State and Non-State Actors specifically MAJ, RBA as well as LAF and its member organisations, vulnerable persons received different legal aid services including legal representation. For example, between 2014

and 2018, RBA defended in courts 2,118 vulnerable persons (425 females and 1653 males) before the Supreme Court and a total of 4,287 minors (2,207 males and 3,879 females). In addition, about 4,555 cases of different categories of vulnerable persons received legal representation through pro-bono scheme. In the same period, around 6,452 persons (1,945 criminal cases and 4,507 civil cases) received legal representation from LAF and its member organisations, while MAJ provided 32,178 vulnerable persons with legal advice and representation in civil matter;⁴⁷

- A number of legal reforms were implemented.⁴⁸ They include the 2018 law on Organisation of Courts which introduced several reforms including the introduction of a new chamber for economic crimes, a new combined chamber for administration and labour disputes, and a new chamber for juveniles and family matters. Another important reform include the establishment of an Appeals Court aimed at lessening the number of case backlog upon the Supreme Court;
- Modernization of the Justice Sector through ICT. Specifically the introduction and use of IECMS technology has greatly improved the access and delivery of justice as all cases now are filed electronically;
- Different measures to curb corruption in the judiciary such as increased awareness raising on fighting corruption in the judiciary through media campaigns on radio, conducting anti-corruption weeks every second week of February every year; establishment of an anti-corruption committee at every level of courts, increased use of IECMS in reducing physical contact with court officers, inspection visits done every quarter to check quality assurance of court judgments, monthly peer review sessions at every court level to analyse the content of decided cases, etc.⁴⁹
- Different activities of capacity building have been conducted for different justice sector stakeholders. For example, about 82 judges were trained on due process rights, other 105 judges were trained on the investigation, prosecution and trial of SGBV.

⁴⁷ Findings of the Assessment of the implementation of the Legal Aid Policy (2020).

⁴⁸ For a detailed analysis of the legal reforms introduced in Rwanda's justice Sector, see Sam Rugege, Rwanda Law Journal, issue no. 1.

⁴⁹ Interview notes with the Spokesperson of the Judiciary.

- Furthermore, between 2015 and 2019, the Institute of Legal Practice and Development (ILPD) organized several training sessions related to human rights and respect of due process of law reaching a total of 2,064 justice sector stakeholders.
- A desk to investigate and respond to cases of enforced disappearances was created at RNP in 2016 and later transferred to the newly established RIB.

Nevertheless, the Coalition would like to point out the following

- There still exist absence of a legal aid law to regulate the coordination, funding and delivery of legal aid services. Consequently, legal aid services remain inadequately coordinated and funded;
- Despite commendable efforts to provide legal representation to vulnerable persons, there is currently a gap between high demand and low supply of legal representation services for the poor. For example, according to existing IECMS data from 2016 to February 2020, out of the 271,083 criminal cases tried by other courts other than the Supreme Court and Court of Appeals, a huge number of plaintiffs totalling to 207,925 (76.7 %) had no defense counsel.⁵⁰ Yet, the dividends of having legal representation in ensuring due process need not be over emphasized. Of all the criminal cases which were handled by courts between 2016 to February 2020, only 63,158 representing 29 % had legal assistance while 207,925 cases representing 71% of the total cases did not;⁵¹
- In addition, the recent merging of courts has increased the total distance travelled to reach the nearest court. This distance is even farther in case of appeal in higher courts, hence becoming more inaccessible, especially for the poor seeking justices;
- The prevalence of corruption in the Judiciary has almost doubled between 2016 and 2018. According to Transparency International Rwanda Bribery Index, the prevalence of corruption in the Judiciary was rated at 5.1% in 2016 and attained 8.42 in 2018;⁵²
- The issue of backlog of cases is on the rise. Comparatively, there has been an increase of 8 % per year on average from 11% in 2016/2017 to 19% in 2017/2018;⁵³

⁵⁰ Data compiled by the Supreme Court from Annual Report from 2016 to February 2020.

⁵¹ Idem.

⁵² TIR, Bribery Index reports for 2016 and 2018, at, <https://www.tirwanda/>

⁵³ Interview notes with the Spokesperson of the Judiciary.

- Despite media reports about cases of alleged enforced disappearances, the Department in charge of enforced disappearance at RIB reported that no case of enforced disappearance was ever reported to it and as such there was no data available on the number of cases of enforced disappearance.⁵⁴ However, some human right organizations and media report cases of enforced disappearance. The Coalition notes with concern that NHRC had documented over 600 cases as “missing persons” and not referred to as cases of enforced disappearance.⁵⁵ In addition, there are insufficient backlogs awareness about what constitutes enforced disappearance and ambiguity between missing persons and enforced disappearance.⁵⁶

Thus the Coalition recommends

- Expedite the enactment of the legal aid law and its supporting Orders to streamline legal aid funding, coordination and eligibility. Specifically, consider expediting measures to establish a fully functional legal aid fund accessible to both State and Non-State legal aid providers with special focus on increasing access to legal representation services in both criminal and civil matters;
- Strengthen measures to investigate cases of enforced disappearance. Specifically, consider, expediting the ratification of the international convention on enforced disappearance as committed to during the second and first UPR reviews. In addition, intensify measures of awareness raising on the crime of enforced disappearance;
- Improve the use of alternative dispute resolution in order to reduce cases coming to formal courts;
- Continue with impressive measures to curb against corruption in justice sector;
- Strengthen the use of ICT, in the justice sector in order to reduce the burden of physical access to courts.

⁵⁴ Interview Notes with RIB

⁵⁵ Interview Notes with RIB and NCHR.

⁵⁶ Idem.

3.4. Humane Treatment in Detention Facilities, Prisons, as well as in Transit and Rehabilitation Centres

Two recommendations on humane treatment in detention facilities, prisons as well as transit and rehabilitation centres, enjoyed the support of Rwanda and were incorporated in the implementation roadmap of UPR recommendations. One recommendation did not enjoy the support of Rwanda. The coalition commends the Government of Rwanda for the following initiatives undertaken thus far:

- New Law N° 20 of 15 May 2017 regulating RCS was adopted. One of the key innovations of the law is the institutionalization of the High Council of RCS. One of the key attributes of the Council is to oversee the respect of rights of incarcerated persons;
- Law N° 17/2017 of 28/04/2017 establishing the National Rehabilitation Service and determining its missions, organization and functioning provides for further legislation to regulate transit and rehabilitation centres. This law defines rehabilitation centres as: "Premises used for the conduct of activities dedicated to reforming, educating and providing professional skills and reintegrate any person exhibiting deviant acts or behaviours". Transit centres are defined as "Premises used for accommodating on temporary basis the people whose behaviours may constitute a cause for placement in the rehabilitation centre";
- In 2017, the Cabinet appointed a Director General in charge of operationalizing the National Rehabilitation Services (NSR);
- Between 2016 and 2017, the Construction of new prisons such as Mageragere in conformity with international standards was completed. In addition, two existing prisons were also renovated (Rwamagana and Huye). Further, two prisons (Nyamagabe and Rubavu) were specifically gazetted for women. Nyagatare Prison continues to be for juvenile offenders;
- Between 2016 and 2017, efforts were made to increase the number and quality of detention facilities at police custody. In this regard, new police stations were built country wide at provincial level and the plan is to scale them up to Sector level. In addition existing police custody cells were renovated;

- According to civil society and NCHR monitoring reports of the situation of police detention facilities and prisons, there is a significant improvement in conditions of detention.

Nevertheless, the Coalition would like to point out the following

- In all Prisons, convicts and non-convicts are not detained separately contrary to international standards;
- Minors are not separately detained from adults in police and RIB detention facilities;
- Although the accommodation space of inmates as calculated by Sq. meter per inmate (5.2 Per sqm/inmate) meets international standards, the sleeping space of 1.13 per sqm/inmate in prison remains below standard;
- There is limited data on the living conditions in transit and rehabilitation centres due to restrictions of access by human rights NGOs.

Thus the Coalition recommends

- Separate convicts from suspects in all prisons
- Separate minors from adults at police/RIB detention centres.
- Promote the use of alternative penalties to imprisonment in the criminal justice to reduce prison population;
- Expedite the process of renovating police detention facilities and transit centres to meet minimum standards.
- Lessen restrictions on access to human rights NGOs to monitor the living conditions of persons in transit and rehabilitation centres.

3.5. Prevention and Punishment of Torture

In relation to prevention and punishment of Torture, Rwanda received and accepted one recommendation and incorporated it into its roadmap. In addition, three recommendations enjoyed the support but were considered to be implemented or in the process of being implemented. The coalition commends the Government of Rwanda for the following:

- As required under CAT & OP-CAT, the NPM was established. Under Article 6 and 7 bis of the revised Law N° 61/2018 of 24/08/2018 modifying Law N° 19/2013 of 25/3/2013 determining missions, organisation and functioning of the NCHR, the latter was designated to serve as the NPM. Two articles outline in detail the responsibilities as well as special powers of NCHR as regards to prevention of torture and other cruel, inhumane or degrading treatment or punishment;
- The Law N°68/2018 of 30/08/2018 determining offences and penalties in general introduced a number of positive reforms in relation to the prevention and punishment of torture in compliance with CAT and OP-CAT.⁵⁷ Article 112 of the Law N°68/2018 of 30/08/2018 defines Torture in tandem with CAT to include acts such as “severe pain or suffering, whether physical or mental, is intentionally inflicted on a person for such purposes as obtaining from him/her or a third person information or a confession, punishing him/her for an act he/she or a third person has committed or is suspected of having committed, or intimidating or coercing him/her or a third person, or for any reason based on discrimination of any kind”. While the definition does not explicitly mention the acquiescence of a public official or by another person acting in an official capacity as defined under Article 1 of CAT, the involvement of a public official or another person acting in an official capacity is implied;
- Further, Article 112 introduces non-derogability of the prohibition of torture and states that “the crime of torture is imprescriptible” in conformity with CAT. Further Article 113 increased the penalties for the crime of torture between six months and two years according to the 2009 penal code to 20-25 years and in cases of aggravating circumstances, up to life imprisonment. Another positive development introduced in the 2018 law determining offences and penalties is the repeal of solitary confinement as a form of punishment under the 2012 penal code;
- Different capacity building trainings on human rights were conducted on the prevention of torture. For example, in 2018-2019, a total of 30 District Police Commanders (DPCs) and 30 investigators from RIB as well as 4 prison commanders were trained on torture. NCHR commissioners and staff were trained on the new mandate of the NPM and how to carry out investigations in torture related matters;⁵⁸

⁵⁷ See concluding observations on the second periodic report of Rwanda, adopted by the CAT Committee at its sixty-second session (6 November-6 December 2017).

⁵⁸ Interview notes with NCHR.

Nevertheless, the Coalition would like to point out the following

- There are no cases documented about torture by NCHR under its new mandate as the designated NPM;
- Awareness raising of the general public on the prevention and punishment of torture remain inadequate. Consequently, the definition, penalties for torture, available remedies for victims of Torture as well as the designated mandate of the NCHR are not well-known among the population.

Thus the Coalition recommends

- Investigate all alleged cases of torture and publish the outcome of the investigations including remedies offered by the NCHR under its new mandate as the NPM;
- Increased awareness campaign targeting law enforcement agents and citizens on the prevention of torture;
- Government should provide timely information to interested parties on cases of torture under investigation.

3.6. Non-Discrimination and Gender Equality

Four recommendations on non-discrimination and gender equality enjoyed the support of Rwanda and were incorporated in the implementation roadmap of UPR recommendations. Three recommendations did not enjoy the support of Rwanda. The coalition commends the Government of Rwanda for the following initiatives:

- The 2003 Constitution as amended in 2015 sets a solid legal and institutional framework for the promotion of gender equality and fighting against all forms of discrimination including gender discrimination. The Constitution further guarantees the equality between men and women. In addition, the Constitution establishes a number of institutions that offer gender equality such as Gender Monitoring Office (GMO), National Women's Council (NWC) , National Youth Council (NYC), Council of persons with disabilities and National Commission for Children;
- A number of legal reforms have been undertaken to ensure gender equality and the fight against gender discrimination such as Law N° 32/2016 of 28/08/2016 governing persons and family. The law

repealed the 1988 civil code book one (CCB I). It also repealed Article 83 which obligated a woman to have as her domicile, the domicile of her husband. Article 119, which allowed only fathers to register children. A mother would only be allowed to do so if the father is not available. It repealed Article 206 of the same Code, which recognized only men as heads of households. Currently, the law recognizes joint management of household by both spouses. Other changes introduced include; granting power of parental authority to either of the parents or any other person;

- The 2016 law governing persons and family was further amended by Law No 001/2020 to ensure progressive realization of gender equality. Key changes include amending Article 215 (paragraph 3), which stated that a widowed woman may not remarry before a period of 300 days following the death of her husband. This was discriminatory and has been amended as follows under article 16 of the new Law N° 001/2020 of 02/02/2020: "A widowed spouse has the right to remarry". Further, article 243 of the same stipulated that in case of divorce, children under the age of six years must live with their mother unless the interests of the children are in danger. This was amended under in article 18 of the new Law N° 001/2020 of 02/02/2020 which provides that, only the best interest of the child should be the benchmark in determining the parent who should have the child custody;
- The GoR has also enacted the Law No 27/2016 of 08/July/2016 governing matrimonial regimes, donations and succession. Article 75 gives equal right to succession to either of the surviving spouse. This is a positive development since the old law (Law NO 22/99 of 12/11/1999 supplementing CCB I and instituting part five regarding matrimonial regimes, liberalities and successions) allowed the surviving female spouse to only administer the family property for children. Moreover, it is also worth noting that, Rwanda has, since 2013, a Law No 43/2013 of 16/06/2013 governing land in Rwanda which provides equal right to land for both spouses;
- In 2016, a new Law No 003/2016 governing maternity leave was enacted. The law introduces a maternity leave benefits insurance scheme to compensate all female employees absent from employment because of pregnancy, giving birth and subsequently caring for the newborn child;

- Efforts to ensure gender mainstreaming in both national and district budgets as provided for under the Organic Budget Law N°12/2013, instituting gender responsive budgeting have been strengthened. Every year MIGEPROF hosts meetings, 2 per year to build capacity of women who participate in budget mainstreaming. At District level, about 45,2 % women participate in budget mainstreaming and 61% women in Parliament participate and approve budget mainstreaming.⁵⁹ In addition, NWC trained women on budget statement in 2017 at District level and at Sector level in all the Districts;
- Improved coordination and harmonized messages during numerous awareness campaigns on gender equality were rolled out by state and non-state actors on gender equality and fight against cultural and patriarchal stereotypes. These include HeForShe campaign, 16 days campaign against GBV, campaigns to celebrate the International Women's day, and the gender and governance month, the NWC permanent program at the village level through parents' evening agenda to promote better understanding between men and women in the fight against discrimination of any form that hinders the full realization of gender equality among others.

Nevertheless, the Coalition would like to point out the following

- Article 56 of the Law N° 66/2018 of 30/08/2018 regulating labour in Rwanda and article 22 of the Law N° 86/2013 of 11/09/2013 give maternity leave of at least twelve consecutive weeks to a female employees who gave birth and only four working days circumstantial leave to male employees whose spouses have given birth. The coalition is of the view that this is against the principle of gender equality between men and women. It was also noted that the terminology used, as "circumstantial leave" for fathers is not appropriate thus needs to be harmonized as parental leave;
- Article 8 of the Labour Code prohibits sexual harassment done by a supervisor to their subordinates but does not take into account sexual harassment done by any other staff not necessarily a supervisor at the workplace;
- There is still a challenge of insufficient resources (both financial and technical) to ensure full gender budget mainstreaming at both district and national levels during planning process;

⁵⁹ NATIONAL WOMEN COUNCIL (NWC) "Empowering Women and Enhancing their Participation in National Development Programs", STRATEGIC PLAN 2015- 2020 on https://www.cnf.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/nwc_strategic_plan_2015-2020.pdf accessed on 15th June 2020.

- There still exist a challenge of gender stereotypes, low mind-set and misconception of the concept of gender equality, negative cultural barriers and practices, low self-esteem among women and lack of awareness on rights granted by the law;
- In addition, there still exist a number of key ILO Conventions deemed to advance gender equality that are not yet ratified by Rwanda.⁶⁰ They include the following:
 - Conventions 156 on Workers with Family Responsibilities;
 - 183 on Maternity Protection;
 - 189 on Domestic Workers;
 - 190 on Violence and Harassment,
 - 131 on Minimum Wage Fixing and
 - P089-Protocol of 1990 to the Convention concerning Night Work of Women Employed in Industry.

Thus the Coalition recommends

- Continue the process of reviewing and amending all the laws with gender discriminatory provisions. Specifically amend articles 8 and 56, of the 2018 Labour Code to ensure full gender equality;
- Consider ratification of ILO Conventions relevant to the promotion of gender equality;
- Continue innovative approaches of sensitization on gender equality focusing on existing legal and policy instruments with a view to positively influence and change negative patriarchal attitudes and stereotypes. In particular, regular monitoring and impact assessments should be carried out to measure positive changes and inform further reforms. Above all, disaggregated data on the number of campaigns, level of outreach should be documented to avoid duplication and maximize outreach;
- Increase technical and financial resources to ensure effective budget mainstreaming at national as well as at decentralized levels. Specifically, in collaboration with the Ministry of Finance and Planning, GMO and MIGEPROF should monitor and ensure that all budget institutions have considered gender issues into their plans.

⁶⁰ See, LAF, Comprehensive Analysis of Gender Compliance under Rwandan Law, 2020.

3.7. Women emancipation, empowerment and participation

Five recommendations on women emancipation, empowerment and participation enjoyed the support of Rwanda and were incorporated in the implementation roadmap of UPR recommendations. Three recommendations were considered as accomplished or being implemented and one recommendation did not enjoy the support of Rwanda. The coalition commends the Government of Rwanda for the following initiatives:

- There exist solid policies to facilitate women's access to education especially for the girl child. These include but not limited to: National Strategy for mentorship of young women and girls, establishment of a department by the Ministry of Education to strengthen its capacity for data collection, analysis and monitoring of gender dimensions, establishment of a gender sensitive school management and administration in the teacher-training curriculum, establishment of a special bursaries and sponsorship program for girls, implementation of gender sensitive programs such as introducing the Girl's Room (*Icyumba cy'umukobwa*) in schools, etc. Consequently, the number of women especially girls accessing education has increased. Specifically cases of missing classes per year estimated at 20% of school girls due to unaffordability of sanitary pads during menstruation period has been addressed. The Girl's Room is equipped with sanitary pads, towels, pain killers, a bed, water, soap, etc. and for the girls who cannot afford to buy sanitary pads, the respective school provides them for the duration of the period; free of charge;
- Efforts to increase the participation of women in leadership at the local government level have been undertaken. They include: trainings and mentorship of women in leadership roles. For example, NWC trained 210 women at District level, about 2,912 women at Sector level and 15,036 women at Cell level as well as 103,887 women at Village. Other interventions include the roll out of Men Engage campaign and effective mobilisation of women through NWC structures from village to national level. Today, NWC leadership is composed of 122,059 female leaders country wide, contributing to further strengthening the framework for women empowerment, advocacy, social mobilization and capacity building. Consequently, there has been a slight increase of women in leadership positions especially at local levels. According to the 2016 local election results, there was a slight increase of women who were

elected as leaders at the village level (from 38.7 % in 2011 to 39.4 % in 2016) and at District level (from 43.2 % in 2011 to 43.6 % in 2016);⁶¹

- During the last five years, the percentage of women's share in the institutions of decision making continued to increase. For example, the percentage of women in the Cabinet increased from 36.8% in 2014 to 50% in 2019 and today, women parliamentarians stand at 61.2% in the lower chamber and 38% in the Senate.⁶² At decentralized level, the percentage of women in leadership raised from 16.7% in 2016 to 30% in 2018 and, following national wide resignation of District Mayors and Vice-Mayors in 2019, mid-term elections were organized. A result of the elections, women were elected to take over four Districts whose mayors have resigned (Nyamasheke, Musanze, Muhanga and Karongi Districts) and thus the total number of women Mayors became 8 out of 30. Thus, women occupy 33% of the total positions of Mayor against 67% men.⁶³ In private sector, the percentage of women in leadership positions varies between 30% for presidential positions and 70% as second vice president in various chambers of PSF;⁶⁴
- Another front which saw increased women leadership at local level is within the agricultural development programs such as land use consolidation, inputs distribution and soil conservation practices. For example, women beneficiaries in land husbandry related works are 10,033 (44.9%) against 12,325 (55.1%) men, women farmers accessing subsidized irrigation equipment are 633 representing 40.66% compared to 949 representing the percentage of 59.33% men;
- Further, at the grass root level, women are playing an important role in conflict management and justice structures. They represent 44.3% of community mediators (Abunzi) and 48% of the MAJ. As lawyers and paralegals; they contribute to providing free legal services to citizens including victims of GBV and child abuse;
- Financial inclusion of women has also increased reaching 63% in 2016 from 36.1% in 2012 due to multifaceted interventions such as BDF guarantee fund, establishment of business development advisors at each sector, etc. Women's membership to Umurenge SACCO has

61 Election report of February and March 2016 for Local level leaders 2016, p.32, http://nec.gov.rw/fileadmin/user_upload/Reports/RAPORO_Y_AMATORA_Y_ABAYOBOZI_BINZEGO_Z_IBANZE_N_AB_INZEGO_ZIHARIYE_YO_MURI_GASHY-ANTARE_NA_WERURWE_2016.pdf f 26Ibid

62 Administrative data gathered from MINALOC by our research team, February 2020.

63 Idem.

64 Administrative data collected from PSF by our research team, February 2020.

increased by 5% from 61% in 2014 to 66.1% in 2018. Currently, women with savings accounts are estimated at 39.7% and the number of women who borrowed from the banking sector more than tripled from 10,254 in June 2011 to 38,282 in June 2016.⁶⁵ Improving access to financial services for the rural poor and women is a particular focus of many banking institutions since 2017;⁶⁶

- Apart from the products channeled through BDF, other commercial banks also have some specific financial support services for women such as “Zamuka Mugore” by the Bank of Kigali (BK), which mainly targets women engaged in economic activities. This product has been very successful. Within four months of implementation, about 1,127 women opened bank accounts, with RWF 32,693,013 paid in as savings, and RWF 462,225,000 paid out as loans. The product is being piloted in five branches, with a plan of scaling up to the other branches at the end of the pilot.
- Overall, efforts on financial inclusion for women during the last four years are impressive. The level of financial exclusion has significantly declined from 32% in 2012 to 13% in 2016 due to enabling conditions such as increased use of Mobile Money services, proximity to financial services by Umurenge SACCOs, agent banking, and improved land ownership which has enabled women get collateral for loans;
- The number of women who have received adult literacy education has increased from 70,053 in 2014 to 81,145 in 2018, although the percentage has remained at around 61% of all people who received adult education. Importantly, adult education has opened opportunities for women to participate in various community led activities and has improved their confidence in different communication settings;
- The Private Sector Development Strategy (2013-2018) shows that women are employed in survival enterprises due to lack of access to decent jobs/formal employment and opportunities to develop their businesses. The strategy has committed to increase economic opportunities for both men and women. In order to achieve that, the sector committed to apply a “gender lens” in each intervention related to the implementation of the strategy, understanding the barriers and issues specifically faced by women as both entrepreneurs and employees and what is required to overcome those barriers and issues.

⁶⁵ MINEDUC, Education Statistical Yearbooks, 2014-2018.

⁶⁶ <https://www.newtimes.co.rw/featured/featured-banking-women-why-access-finance-rwanda-thinks-women-are-future> visited on 3rd June 2020.

Apart from this strategy, there are other programs and initiatives aimed to facilitate women's participation in entrepreneurship and business development;

- With HeForShe Rwanda's impact commitments implementation, female enrollment in TVET has increased from 41.8% in 2015 to 43.8% in 2018. Number of female students with disabilities increased from 44.8% in 2015 up to 47% in 2017 in primary schools and from 47.0% in 2015 to 50.5% in 2017 in secondary education.⁶⁷ As a result of these initiatives, female's representation in ICT education has positively changed from 32.3% in 2015/16 to 41.8% in 2016/17. In addition, ICT has facilitated the use of E-learning system for women and girls, which offers a great opportunity to access required skills and education without prejudice to their daily responsibilities. Enrollment of girls in STEM, digital fluency and literacy are being reinforced by innovative initiatives for STEM awareness campaigns like Teck Women, MISS GEEK, Techkobwa and WeCode programs. The number of girls participating in these new emerging fields such as STEM and digital fluency and literacy is currently estimated at 45.6%;⁶⁸
- ICT industry is an emerging key sector facilitating rapid economic growth. Therefore, women's participation in this very sector will yield significant contributions in social and economic transformation. The country has introduced multiple programs meant to bridge the gender digital divide and attain parity in access, usage, and innovation. Some of the initiated strategies comprise WEM TECH strategy, Girls in ICT mentorship and networking, and Digital Ambassador Program etc.⁶⁹

Nevertheless, the Coalition would like to point out the following

- While significant progress has been made with regard to the number of women in the decision making institutions, there still exist a challenge linked to women's representation in leadership at the lowest level of administration, especially at sector and cell levels. For example, their percentage regressed from 43.9% in 2016 to 41.7 % in 2017. It also regressed at sector level from 45.1% in 2011 to 42.7% in 2016;⁷⁰
- Another important issues is linked to the fact that certain roles are gender biased. For example, the position of Vice-Mayor for Social

67 Idem.

68 Beijing_25_Country_Report.pdf p. 31.

69 Idem.

70 Administrative data collected from MINALOC by our research team, February 2020.

Affairs are predominantly reserved for Women (66.7% compared to 33 % men) and only 16.7% women compared to 83.7% men occupy the position of Vice-Mayor in charge of Economic Affairs;⁷¹

- Women participation in the agriculture sector continue to be limited due to a number of factors such as limited access to agricultural inputs including fertilizers, low use of improved seeds, limited access to Agriculture credit, low membership in Agricultural cooperatives, little involvement in high value agriculture chains etc. For example, only 27 women are involved in seed multiplication against 129 men.⁷² The low involvement of women in seed multiplication is due to limited land size, capital and modern agricultural skills. For example in terms of inputs, the 2017 Agricultural household survey, reported male headed households used more organic fertilizers at 80.9% in season A and 64% in season B, than female HHs at 75% in season A and 59% in season B. In terms of seed, report shows male HHs more involved in the use of improved seeds at 25.9% in season A and 33.6% in season B than female HHs at 18.6% in season A and 26.9% in season B, while Female HHs reported high levels of use of traditional seeds at 98.6% in season A and 98.7% in season B to 98.6% respectively for male HHs in both seasons;⁷³
- The number of women accessing agricultural credit is still low compared to men. For example, the percentage of women accessing agriculture loans is estimated to 25.5% against 74.5 % men.⁷⁴ Further, according to the Agricultural Survey 2017, nationwide, around 38.9% of the households requested loans in Tontine and 35.4% borrowed from SACCO. The same report states that female-headed households work more with tontine and borrow money from friends at 9.2% and 51.3% respectively compared to male-headed households rated at 4.1% and 36.8% respectively. It is clear that male-headed households were more involved in working with financial institutions than female-headed households. Despite the increase in percentage of women having saving accounts, it is clear that a high percentage of female (57%) continue to save informally compared to 54% male who save informally;⁷⁵

71 Administrative data gathered from MINALOC by our research team, February 2020.

72 GMO, Gender Profile in Agriculture, March 2017 on http://gmo.gov.rw/rw/fileadmin/user_upload/profiles/Gender_Profile_in_Agriculture_GMO_March_2017.pdf visited on 4th June 2020.

73 Idem.

74 GMO, The state of gender equality in Rwanda from transition to transformation, 2019 ON http://gmo.gov.rw/fileadmin/user_upload/Researches%20and%20Assessments/State%20of%20Gender%20Equality%20in%20Rwanda.pdf visited on 12th June 2020.

75 Idem.

- According to the Labour Force Survey of 2018, women spend an average of 25.3 hours per week on unpaid care work compared to 13.5 hours per week for their male counterparts. This limits women's participation in productive and paid economic activities as well as in political and leadership spheres. This does not only affect women as individuals but also the whole national economy. Consequently, women membership in agriculture cooperatives and other informal associations is low compared to that of men. This is mainly attributed to the distribution of family responsibilities which leave women with limited time to participate in other development initiatives;
- Despite high representation of women in agriculture sector, they are more engaged in high value chains such as agro-processing, marketing and export. Also gender power relations in the households determine who sells produce and who controls the money gained from the sale. Consequently, men who are in most cases heads of households sell agriculture product and control money from the sale;
- Limited access to sexual and reproductive health information and services, especially controlled access to contraception and cultural beliefs making young people extremely vulnerable to unintended pregnancies and impeding their ability to access education and employment.

Thus, the Coalition recommends

- Continue with impressive interventions in terms of education, poverty alleviation, changing toxic masculine attitudes and beliefs and affirmative actions aimed at increasing women empowerment and participation;
- Implement programmatic interventions aimed at sensitization on behavior change aimed at balancing unpaid care work between women and men;
- Strengthen women's access to sexual and reproductive health services including family planning notably through strengthened awareness;
- Intensify capacity building efforts through leadership training and mentorship for women especially young girls;
- Intensify existing programs on accelerating women's access to finance and credit schemes such as mobilization of savings in the community, initiatives designed to make men and women save in order to access different services and opportunities including loans offered by financial institutions;

- Increase men engagement in the fight of SGBV;
- Strengthen coordination, monitoring, evaluation, and reporting of interventions against GBV as well as engaging men in the fight of SGBV.

3.8. Prevention and Response to SGBV

Rwanda received and accepted three recommendations and incorporated them into its roadmap. Six recommendations enjoyed the support but were considered to be implemented or in the process of being implemented and two recommendations did not enjoy the support of Rwanda.

The country operated several reforms in the area of combatting SGBV. Admittedly, there has been an increase in the number of GBV cases reported but this is more likely linked to increased awareness and the imperative to fight against silence and impunity with regard to GBV cases. According to RIB, in 2018 there were 13,816 cases of SGBV reported and the number increased to 19,269 in 2019. The issue of prevention of SGBV has been given more attention than before. This is particularly evidenced by the rise of the number of teen mothers in the recent years. The coalition commends the Government of Rwanda for the following initiatives:

- Amendment of laws such as the constitution, family law, the law determining offenses and penalties in general (penal code) and the Law N° 51/2018 of 13/08/2018 relating to the prevention, suppression and punishment of trafficking in persons and exploitation of others;
- In terms of prevention, much has been done through various campaigns that were conducted at grass-roots level by both state and non-state actors to strengthen community mandatory reporting on all forms of violence. Other initiatives include GBV clinics that are conducted every year country wide to ensure accountability of GBV service providers at the decentralized levels and raise awareness on the available GBV services. Regular campaigns including Radio and TV talk shows are conducted to raise awareness on GBV;
- Interventions in the area of legal aid services have been provided through collaborative efforts between state and non-state actors. For example, between 2014/15 and 2018/19, the number of women who received different legal aid services (legal advice, representation, etc.) increased from 11,533 to 37,146;⁷⁶

⁷⁶ MINIJUST, Annual reports, 2014/15 & 2018/19.

- The services of Isange One Stop Centers in responding to SGBV have been scaled up in all referral and District hospitals. According to MIGEPROFE, the target of 43 IOSCs by 2017⁷⁷ has been surpassed as there are now of 44 IOCs country wide. They provide holistic 24 hour response to victims and survivors of GBV including safe shelter, medical, psychosocial counseling and legal aid to the victims under one roof so as to avoid revictimization and the risk of spoiled evidence. IOSCs recorded a total of 9,243 cases of SGBV in 2019 while the record of 2018 was of 6,550 cases;
- Rwanda Forensic Laboratory and RIB have been established and continue to provide communities with rapid, victim focused and user friendly GBV response services. More specifically, the Rwanda Forensic Laboratory is a key milestone with regard to the investigation of SGBV crimes because it enables gathering of undisputable DNA evidence to help in prosecution and trail of perpetrators of SGBV;
- GMO monitors quality of services provided and conducts assessment of service delivery in IOSCs as well as the quality of infrastructure set-up;
- RNP has conducted a number of outreach programs in schools, motorcyclists, and cyclist drivers, leaders at grassroots level and Community Health Workers among others in combating/preventing and reporting SGBV cases in the whole country. From 2016 to 2019, about 3800 outreach programs were conducted, and around 424,265 people have participated. RNP in collaboration with other security organs and local leaders regularly conducts awareness campaign countrywide through "Parents' gatherings" (*Umugoroba w'ababyeyi*);
- Between 2018 and 2019, RNP has established 1830 anti-SGBV crimes clubs and through this program, around 1600 cases were reported to RNP for further management;
- A number of SGBV prevention mechanisms have been set up such, "Umugoroba w'ababyeyi"; home grown education, Gender Accountability Day, etc. For example, a total of 51 media representatives including 35 women were trained on prevention of SGBV. In 2019 Gender Accountability Day was conducted in Ngororero, Rulindo Districts and around 2,308 women participated;

⁷⁷ GMO, From victims to leading actors. Rwanda's Gender Dividend, 2016 on http://www.gmo.gov.rw/fileadmin/user_upload/other%20publications/Rwan accessed on 12th June 2020.

- Some CSOs have pursued innovative models in response to SGBV. For example, LIWOHA⁷⁸ has deployed the community based approach towards SGBV which is a dynamic process where community members willing to recover from life wounds induced by domestic and sexual violence agree to share their lived experiences, to work on them accordingly and to support each other in this healing journey. The model is holistic in nature involving offering a complete package of medical, legal, social, psychological and economic interventions and enabling SGBV victims and perpetrators become agents of change in their respective communities. As a result of the model, one of the villages (Kankuba cell, Mageragere sector, Nyarugenge District) where the model is implemented, was named by MINALOC, RNP as a model village in the fight against SGBV reported in 2018.

Despite impressive interventions in responding to SGBV, the Coalition is concerned with the following

- Interventions aimed at prevention are not holistic enough to cover medical, psycho-social, legal and economic dimensions. The interventions are much more centered on perpetrators than on victims;
- IOSCs are challenged for inadequate resources (financial, technical and human resource) to conduct comprehensive prevention of SGBV initiatives;
- Underlying factors leading to SGBV such as toxic masculinity, poverty, negative cultural attitudes, etc. are not fully addressed.

Thus, the Coalition recommends

- Intensify coordinated efforts and strategies to prevent SGBV especially among adolescent girls;
- IOSCs need more technical and financial resources to increase their effectiveness especially in terms of their outreach. Efforts to scale up IOSCs at the Sector level as indicated in the 2011-2017 strategic plan should be expedited up to the level of health facilities. In particular there should be more to educate the personnel of these centres on the rights of women with disabilities and equipping the facilities with up-to-date technology for example braille and sign language interpreters;

⁷⁸ More information on the work of LIWOHA can be accessed at <http://liwoha.org>.

- Put efforts in holistic and multi-dimensional approaches such as focusing on behaviour change, economic empowerment of women and girls, strong coordination, monitoring, evaluation, and reporting of interventions against GBV as well as engaging men in the fight of GBV. LIWOHA Model of community participation in SGBV response may be considered for scale-up;
- Put in place stronger policies to help young women and girls easily access sexual and reproductive health information and services;
- Create and encourage more safe spaces for teenagers to discuss their issues;
- Ensure Availability and accessibility of user-friendly information for teens and services provided by their peers.

3.9. Human Trafficking

In relation to human trafficking in particular child trafficking, Rwanda received and accepted two recommendations. Moreover, three recommendations enjoyed the support of Rwanda but were considered to be implemented or in the process of being implemented and two recommendations were rejected. The coalition commends the Government of Rwanda for the following initiatives:

- The Government of Rwanda has made significant achievements in combatting trafficking in the country; including the enactment of a comprehensive Law N° 51/2018 of 13/08/2018 relating to the prevention, suppression and punishment of human trafficking;
- In line with the prevention and suppression of the crime of human trafficking, the Government has conducted a number capacity building trainings for RIB, NPPA, soldiers before deployment to foreign, missions, immigration officers, labor inspectors and country's Diplomats on fighting human trafficking. For example, from 2015-16, MINIJUST in collaboration with ILPD trained 23 people on investigation and prosecution of human trafficking. MINIJUST prepared a Human Trafficking Training Manual (2016) and disseminated it to all stakeholders for its use;
- In addition, mass sensitization campaigns on fighting human trafficking have been undertaken countrywide during Legal Aid Week and especially targeting youth especially in schools and through radio programs;

- In terms of protection and response to cases of human trafficking, RIB continued to operate a 15-officer anti-trafficking unit in its Criminal Investigations Division. In addition, RNP directorate for anti-gender-based violence had three officers in each of the country's 78 police stations who served as points of contact for trafficking victims;⁷⁹
- From 2016/2017 to 2018/2019, the total of 190 cases of human trafficking were received and investigated by NPPA and 89 cases representing 46.8% were filed in courts;⁸⁰
- All the 44 IOSCs country wide have been mandated to protect and provide relevant services such as medical and psychosocial services to victims of human trafficking;
- MAJ is attached to IOSCs to provide legal advice and support to victims throughout the legal process;
- Cooperation between RIB, RNP and regional and international Police agencies has been strengthened to bring back trafficked persons.

Nevertheless, the Coalition would like to point out the following

- The government has not yet adopted an updated National Anti-Trafficking Action Plan to coordinate national anti-trafficking efforts;⁸¹
- IOSCs mandate to deal with human trafficking calls for reciprocal financial, human and technical support in order to increase its efficiency;
- Limited resources to respond to human trafficking;
- Inadequate victim testimonies and a challenge in identification of victims;
- Inadequate psycho-social, shelter, and legal support services for victims of child trafficking;
- Insufficient cooperation mechanisms with other countries;
- Insufficient measures to address the root causes and driving factors of human trafficking in Rwanda including poor socio-economic living conditions, family pressure and youth unemployment.⁸²

79 State Department Report on Trafficking in Persons Report-Rwanda (2019) Rwanda, <https://www.state.gov/reports/2019-trafficking-in-persons-report-2/rwanda/>

80 NHRC, UPR final Assessment report on the implementation of the recommendations issued to Rwanda during the second cycle of Universal Periodic Review of 2015, January 2020, p.55.

81 State Department Report on Human Trafficking, idem.

82 NEVER AGAIN RWANDA, End Human Trafficking: No one is free until we are all free, (2019) on <http://neveragainrwanda.org/end-human-trafficking-no-one-is-free-until-we-are-all-free/#> visited on 12th June 2020.

Thus, the Coalition recommends

- Continue sensitization drive on the evils of human trafficking targeting especially the youth;
- Intensify efforts to punish perpetrators of human trafficking especially those involved in internal human trafficking;
- Increase resources and better coordinate services aimed at rehabilitation (physical, social-psycho support) as well as and legal aid support services to victims of human trafficking;
- Strengthen grass-roots child protection to monitor and prevent child trafficking;
- Intensify efforts for poverty eradication as the main cause leading to youth vulnerability and falling prey to traffickers.

3.10. The Right to Child Registration at Birth for all Children

In relation to the right to child registration at birth for all children, Rwanda received and accepted one recommendation and incorporated it into its roadmap of UPR implementation. Besides, one recommendation enjoyed the support but was considered to be implemented or in the process of being implemented and four recommendations did not enjoy the support of Rwanda. The coalition commends the Government of Rwanda for the following initiatives:

- The revised family law in its article 100 extended the duration of registering a child from 15 days to 30 days. Registration procedures were simplified to allow the registration of a child by a single parent;
- The new Law N° 001/2020 of 02/02/2020 governing persons and family in Art.1 para. 2 states that an officer of the health facility has the power of civil registrar to record births and deaths that occur in the health facility. In 2019, birth registration increased to 60%, with the initiated system of immediately registering new born in hospitals will contribute to increase the number of child birth registration. With the new law, E-registration at birth at health facilities was introduced and rolled out in all public health facilities with effect from the year 2020;
- From 2017 to 2019, child birth registration campaigns were conducted by both state and non-state actors in Musanze, Kicukiro, Huye, Gisagara, Nyamasheke and Ruhango, Nyamata, Nyaruguru and Gatsibo Districts where around 2,000 children were registered;

- A system to register children born as refugees is in place and implemented across all refugee camps in Rwanda.

Nevertheless, the Coalition would like to point out the following

- Majority of children registered through mass campaigns did not receive birth certificates;
- Internet connectivity is a challenge at some health centres while it is necessary for use of CRVS;
- The amount paid in as the fine for late birth registration (FRW 10,000) has been reported to be high for the majority of the population and has been pointed out as one of the causes preventing them from registering a birth once they have missed the 30-day prescribed by law. In addition, the cost of birth certificates (FRW 1000) has been deemed high for some people.⁸³

Thus the Coalition recommends

- Continue rigorous sensitization drive to register all children. In particular, maintain a waiver on penalties for late registration;
- Provide registered children during mass drive campaigns with valid birth certificates;
- Conduct continuous sensitisation campaigns on the importance of birth registration aimed at both the population and civil registrars;
- Scale up efforts to raise awareness on the new law on persons and family;
- Increase campaigns to educate parents on the importance of child registration at birth;
- Involve Community Health Workers in activities around registration. As they follow up pregnancies, they can also sensitise parents on the importance of birth registration and all the procedures involved;
- Support vulnerable people to get birth certificates for their children, free of charge;
- To facilitate better use of ICT by ensuring constant internet connectivity in all sectors including in remote areas.

⁸³ LAF, Assessment Report of the status of birth registration in Bugesera, Gatsibo and Nyaruguru Districts (2019).

3.11. The Right to Education

In relation to the right to education, Rwanda received and accepted two recommendations and incorporated them into its roadmap of UPR implementation.

In addition, twelve recommendations enjoyed the support but were considered to be implemented or in the process of being implemented and one recommendation did not enjoy the support of Rwanda.

Overall, significant progress made include; in Primary schools, the number of pupils enrolled has increased from 97.7% in 2016 to 98.3% (2018). In secondary schools, gross enrollment rate increased from 38.8% in 2017 to 39.3% in 2018.⁸⁴

There is a significant effort in ensuring access to education for all. Enrollment of learners with disabilities is at 0.5% in nursery schools, 0.7% in primary schools, and 0.7% in secondary schools. MINEDUC EMIS data of July 2018 show that 32,241 children and young persons with disabilities: 14,733 (or 46%) being female, were enrolled in Rwandan schools. 1,259 children with disabilities (671 boys; 588 girls) pre-primary pupils; 23,863 primary pupils with disabilities (13,070 boys; 10,793 girls); 6,153 secondary students (3,141 boys; 3,012 girls) and 966 students with disabilities in Vocational Training Centers (626 male; 340 female).⁸⁵ The Coalition would like to commend the following positive:

- Since 2015, the Government has adopted several legal and policy reforms aimed at improving the quality and access to education at all levels. These include but not limited to; adoption of school competence based curriculum (2015) replacing the knowledge-based curriculum, Ministerial Instructions N° 001/ MINEDUC/2020 of 21/02/2020 regulating the promotion, repetition, dismissal and transfer, which stipulates among others that, no pupil or learner shall be automatically promoted without academic merit to the next class;⁸⁶ revised special needs and inclusive education policy (2018) special needs and its implementation strategic plan 2018/19-2023/24; ministerial instructions no 003/03 of 23/12/2017 determining the organisation and functioning of the National Early Childhood Development Program (NECDP); Law N° 36/2018 of 29/06/2018 determining the organization

84 MINEDUC, Rwanda Education Statistics year Book, 2018, p. 16.

85 MINEDUC, EDUCATION SECTOR STRATEGIC PLAN 2018/19 TO 2023/24, on http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/NDPR/ Sector_Strategic_Plans/Education.pdf visited on 15th June 2020.

86 Article 10 of Ministerial Instructions No 001/MINEDUC/2020 of 21/02/2020 regulating the promotion, repetition, dismissal and transfer, www.mineduc.gov.rw

of education defines that the mission of the Rwandan education is to provide quality courses and education towards self-development and national development in general.

- Since 2016, Government has implemented a number of program interventions aimed at improving access to and quality of education. These include;
 - Adoption of the National Strategy for Transformation (2017–2024);
 - The establishment of a specialized Government entity in charge of promoting early childhood development and care (2019);
 - Introduction of ICT in schools. Computers are available in nearly 70 percent of the primary schools and 85 percent of secondary schools ICT has been introduced for teaching and learning in 44% of primary and 60 percent of secondary schools. The Smart Classroom and ICT devices in teaching and learning are available for 55 % of secondary schools across the country as well as implementation of the new competence based curriculum; The Internet is accessible in 25% of primary and in more than 40% of secondary schools;⁸⁷
 - Strengthen the English language proficiency and digital literacy through e-learning. The following activities are in the phase of implementation: (i) development of online courses, assessment tools for enhancement of English language proficiency and digital literacy skill development of teachers, (ii) review and strengthening of the e-learning platform;
 - School feeding: School feeding program in secondary schools is implemented where by 2018 the % of secondary school participating in school feeding was 77. 6%.⁸⁸
 - The education sector budget allocation for 2018/19 amounts to 273.0 billion Rwandan francs (FRW). This indicates a nominal increase of 161% compared to the approved budget in 2015/16.⁸⁹

87 MINEDUC, Education Sector Strategic Plan 2018/19 TO 2023/24, Idem.

88 Idem

89 UNICEF, Education Budget Brief, Investing in child education in Rwanda 2018/2019, p. 3.

Nevertheless, the Coalition would like to point out the following

- Quality of education at all levels is qualified as low, estimated at 53.6%.⁹⁰ The most cited reasons include: high teacher-student ratio, school rationing, limited equipment such as laboratories and libraries, unstable medium of instruction, poor living conditions of teachers among others. The 2017 LARS (Learning Achievements in Rwandan school) assessment found that only 54% of grade 3 pupils in Kinyarwanda and 59% in mathematics reached expected grade-level benchmarks;
- According to MINEDUC annual Report 2018, net enrollment rate in schools is still at 58.2%. In addition, there is a high repetition rate of 91.8% and a school high drop-out rate of 33.5%;⁹¹
- The professional competence of teachers is low due to failing to cope with the transition from French as former instruction language into English;
- Despite high number of enrollment, completion rates remain low. Repetition and dropout rates in primary school are at 16% and 6% percent respectively. By grade 6, it is estimated that about 85% of children in the education system have repeated at least once.⁹² Among the core causes of school drop-outs is the issue of "hidden school fees" in form of teachers' facilitation fees, child defilement and teenage pregnancies, drug abuse, and underperformance of PTAs to keep an oversight function in their respective schools; qualified teachers in special needs education, etc.;
- Although gender parity between boys and girls has been bridged, girls still face special challenges compared to boys, which need special attention. The number of school dropouts is still high for girls compared to boys. Teenage pregnancy has led to permanent school drop out for girls. Access to safe spaces for girls is still not accessible in the majority of schools. As a result, some girls do miss school while in the periods;
- Challenges related to early childhood care and education: The program is still new and a lot has to be done in terms of scale up especially in rural areas, curriculum development and endowed with qualified care givers/educators. The program is also marred with low quality in ECD

90 Citizens Report Card (2019).

91 MINEDUC annual Report 2018.

92 Assessment of Repetition and Dropout in Basic Education in Rwanda,

service provision. Children are supposed to be provided with integrated services like: health services, nutrition services, sanitation services, education services, child protection services, parenting services, and disability related services and early stimulation.

- Poor coordination and management of school programs such as One Laptop per Child Program and the school feeding program. This has resulted in poor results or negative results compared to the anticipated ones. For example, one laptop per child has not been scaled up in rural schools because of lack of electricity while in some schools, school feeding for those who are able to pay while those who cannot afford was seen as a form of another discrimination between the rich and the poor;
- The challenge of education for children with disabilities: there is need to increase focus on education for children with disabilities and other special needs. They have challenges to access education materials, qualified teachers in special needs education etc. Education in Rwanda at primary, secondary and university or tertiary education does not fully respond to the needs of persons with disabilities. Although Rwanda is under the process of developing an all-inclusive education at the College of Education, trained personnel at all levels of education are still lacking and an accessible learning material remains a serious obstacle. Most universities in Rwanda do not offer education to the deaf and the blind. Most lecturers at Universities in Rwanda acknowledge shortage of skills to train and equip students with disabilities especially the Deaf and Visual Impaired People.

Thus the Coalition commends

- Continue with reforms aimed at increasing the quality of education;
- Increase the government budget to the education sector for funding for 12 YBE to equip them with modern facilities which fosters learning such as libraries, laboratories, etc.
- Continue the reforms aimed at improving the economic and professional capacity of teachers;
- Strengthen the role of PTAs in the fight against school dropouts and increasing the role of parents in the education of their children;
- Continue reforms aimed at removing all barriers hindering girl child

education and access to education for children/students with disabilities and special needs;

- To take all appropriate measures to ensure the right of all children with disabilities to quality and inclusive education; including by removing physical, communication, information, and other barriers;
- Ensuring the provision of reasonable accommodation, assistive devices, support and accessible curricula, Materials and environment for PWDs;
- To provide information on steps taken by the government of Rwanda to produce disaggregated data on disability, in the education sector, using the Washington group set of questions;
- To provide information on steps taken by the Government of Rwanda to provide support for families with children's with disabilities to ensure they actually attend education;
- To provide information on steps taken by the Government of Rwanda to move away from especial education schools to inclusive education for children with disabilities;
- To provide information on steps taken by the government of Rwanda to increase awareness about the rights to education for children with disabilities and to reduce stigma and bullying in schools and communities.

3.12. The Right to Health

As regards the right to Health, Rwanda received and accepted two recommendations and incorporated them into its roadmap of UPR implementation. In addition, three recommendations enjoyed the support but were considered to be implemented or in the process of being implemented and three recommendations did not enjoy the support of Rwanda and were thus noted. The Coalition would like to commend the positive steps implemented thus:

- Prime Minister's order N° 078/03 of 25/07/2019 related to community-based health insurance scheme subsidies;
- Prime Minister's Order N° 034/01 of 13/01/2020 related to the community-based health insurance scheme subsidies;
- Law N°68/2018 of 30/08/2018 determining offences and penalties in

general makes an exemption from criminal liability for abortion where it stipulates that there is no criminal liability if abortion was performed due to the following reasons: the pregnant person is a child; the person having abortion had become pregnant as a result of rape; the person having abortion had become pregnant after being subjected to a forced marriage; the person having abortion had become pregnant as a result of incest up to the second degree; the pregnancy puts at risk the health of the pregnant person or of the foetus. This law recognized that the abortion is performed by a recognized medical doctor and conditions to be satisfied for a medical doctor to perform an abortion are determined by an Order of the Minister in charge of health;⁹³

- The law on the Protection of the Rights of Persons with Disabilities in general (Law N°1/2007) recognizes the right of a person with disability to health, especially access to medical care, including access to artificial limbs and hearing aids, in case of need (Article 14. This law obliges centres or associations that provide care to Persons with Disabilities to have a trauma and psychosocial counselling service in the area of mental health (Article 16);
- The Coalition commends the Government of Rwanda for increasing the number of people who access HIV Treatment. The number of health facilities offering HIV Testing and Counselling (HTC) increased from 569 in 2016 to 577 health facilities in 2017; and a Mobile Voluntary Counselling and Testing approach was also organized in different hotspots. In the same move to scale up HIV testing services, Rwanda has also started implementing HIV self-testing as an additional HIV testing approach.⁹⁴ The Government of Rwanda has reduced child mortality rate (50/1000) as well as maternal mortality rate (210/100,000);⁹⁵ The country recognizes remarkable progress towards achieving HIV epidemic control, particularly in attaining high levels of linkage to treatment and viral load suppression among people living with HIV;
- Construction district hospitals and health center at sector level.

⁹³ Law N°68/2018 of 30/08/2018 determining offences and penalties in general, Article 125.

⁹⁴ Rwanda National Commission for Human Rights, UPR final Assessment report on the implementation of the recommendations issued to Rwanda during the second cycle of Universal Periodic Review of 2015, January 2020, p.67.

⁹⁵ UNICEF RWANDA Country Profile on <https://www.unicef.org/rwanda/media/726/file/2019-UNICEF-Rwanda-Country-Profile.pdf> visited on 4th June 2020.

- High coverage of health insurance scheme CBI in 2018 was at 83.6 %⁹⁶ coverage from 74% in EICV5⁹⁷;
- In 2019 Rwanda launched the use of Minimally Invasive Surgery, an inner body surgical operations without using the normal cutting materials but using technological rays;
- The use of drone delivery system of blood and other essential medicines urgently needed in hospitals in Rwanda;
- The waiver of VAT on sanitary pads in order to increase their accessibility for girls and women;
- Rwanda has a limited but increasing number of health specialists able to manage disabling health conditions and in some cases provide timely treatment that prevents disability. These are audiologists (6); ophthalmologists (14); plastic surgeons (1).

However, the Coalition would like to point out the following

- The Coalition is concerned with the management of community based health insurance scheme commonly known as *Mutuelle de santé* including frequent lack of some essential medicine in some public health centres and district pharmacies.⁹⁸ Subscribers have to buy their own medicine whenever there is stock out in the public health centres or in case the prescribed drugs are not available in the public health facilities. The universal health insurance scheme (*Mutuelle de santé*.) is also marred with irregularities and complaints especially in relation to its basis on *Ubudehe* categorizations; Most people in the second category of *Ubudehe* are unable to pay premiums;
- Limited human and technical skills for health centres: 1 nurse per 1,261 people, 1 medical doctor per 8,919 people, 1 midwife per 4,064 people, 1 pharmacist per 16,871 people, 1 lab technician per 10,500;⁹⁹
- Limited number of specialized doctors: The target of NST1 is; 1 doctor per 7000 people by 2024 from the baseline of 2018 where 1 doctor is for 10,055 people;¹⁰⁰

96 HSSP4, MOH reports 2017; Journal of Environmental and Public Health, Volume 2018, Article ID 2624591, 9 pages: <https://doi.org/10.1155/2018/2624591>

97 NISR, The Fifth Integrated Household Living Conditions Survey, EICV5, p.vi.

98 The majority of the Rwandan population subscribes to the Community based Health Insurance Scheme.

99 MoH, Annual report cited by RGB, RGS 6th Edition, opcit, p.32.

100 MINECOFIN, 7 Years Government Programme: National Strategy for Transformation (NST 1) 2017 – 2024 Finalon http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/user_upload/NST1_7YGP_Final.pdf visited on 15th June 2020.

- Long distance to access health facilities estimated at 8 km and an average time of 49, 9 minutes to reach a health center.¹⁰¹
- Inability to access public hospitals directly without transfer from a health Centre for people CBHI.
- Limited internet connectivity frustrates effective examination and medication of patients;
- Lack of accessible public health education for PWDs, health care facilities and services, including emergency services, sexual and reproductive health services, and HIV/AIDS prevention, treatment, care and support programs, particularly in remote, rural areas;
- Lack of adequate training of health professionals on the human rights of persons with disabilities, including on free and informed consent;
- Lack of specific measures on persons with albinism in policies governing health and disability, in particular concerning the prevention and treatment of skin cancer;
- The adolescent sexual and reproductive health and the maternal and child health policies are silent about the rights and needs of women/ girls with disabilities regarding Sexual Reproductive Health;
- The community health based insurance known as “Mutuelle de Santé” does not cover the rehabilitation services like physiotherapy and occupational therapy nor assistive devices, which most women with disabilities need to ensure their inclusion and participation in society on an equal basis with others in education, employment, political participation etc.
- Persons with deaf impairment are still facing the issue of communication with health service providers at health centres due to limited knowledge of sign language;
- Budget allocation for infectious diseases has declined over the years from FRW 17.8 billion in 2017/18 to FRW 11 billion in 2019/2020.¹⁰²

¹⁰¹ Idem.

¹⁰² UNICEF, Health Budget Brief Investing in children’s health in Rwanda 2019/2020, on https://www.unicef.org/esa/media/5911/file/UNICEF_Rwanda-Health_Budget_brief_2019.pdf visited on 15th June 2020.

Thus the Coalition recommends

- Increase the budget allocation to the health sector in order cover areas which need urgent attention such as increasing the number of professional doctors, supply of essential drugs in health centres, increased subsidization of Mutuelle de santé to provide more services for persons with disabilities, as well as overall modernization of the health sector;
- Increase access to obstetrical care services especially in geographically hard to reach areas;
- Increase the number of professional doctor ratio to patients;
- Government to consider CBI access to all health facilities including private health centres and pharmacies;
- Government to consider vulnerable population in category 2 to also be fully subsidized by government;
- Ensure full supply of essential drugs and to be covered by CBHI;
- Government to incentivize students taking medicine and produce more doctors;
- Construct more health centres and health posts especially in rural area;
- Provide reliable internet connectivity to all health facilities in the country;
- Adopt specific measures on persons with albinism in policies governing health and disabilities, ensuring the availability, accessibility, affordability and quality of prevention and treatment for skin cancer;
- Take measures to ensure universal, affordable, non-discriminatory access to quality health care services for all persons with disabilities, including refugees with disabilities;
- Raise awareness of the rights of persons with disabilities among medical professionals through training and the promulgation of ethical standards, including on the right to free and informed consent;

- Adopt and implement a strategy to ensure the availability and accessibility of public health education, health care services and facilities for all persons with disabilities including emergency services, sexual and reproductive health services and HIV/AIDS prevention, treatment, care and support programs.

3.13. The Right to Employment and Decent Working Conditions

In relation to employment and decent working conditions, Rwanda received and accepted one recommendation and incorporated it into its roadmap of UPR implementation. In addition, one recommendation enjoyed the support of Rwanda but was considered to be implemented or in the process of being implemented.

The Government committed to create 1,500,000 jobs under the NST 1 between 2017 and 2024; the total Net Jobs created between 2017 and 2018 is 206,190 including non-farm jobs (166,058 equivalent to 81%), farm jobs (40,132 representing 19% of farm based jobs).¹⁰³

The population of 16 years old and over is estimated at 7,320,999 while the labour force is 4,025,992 and the number of employed population attains 3,406,000 while those who are unemployed are 620,115 and outside labour force estimated at 3,295,007. The number of employed persons has increased from about 3,153,000 in August 2019 (Q3) to about 3,406,000 in November 2019 (Q4).¹⁰⁴

According to the Labour Force Survey results of the November 2019(Q4), the unemployment rate in Rwanda was 15.4 percent compared to 16.0 percent in August 2019(Q3) and 15.0 percent in May 2019(Q2).

The full count of young in the age group 16 to 24 years old, who were neither in employment nor in education or training, was 727,546 persons while for those aged between 16 and 30 years old, the total number was 1,149,817 persons in November 2019(Q4).¹⁰⁵

¹⁰³ NISR, Labour Force Survey Trends, November 2019, p. 56.

¹⁰⁴ Ibid.

¹⁰⁵ Idem, p.59.

The Coalition would like to commend the positive steps implemented thus far:

- The new Law N° 66/2018 of 30/08/2018 regulating labour in Rwanda that provides basic labour rights, including such as the prohibition of child labour, the prohibition of forced labour, the protection of workers against violence or harassment, the prohibition of discriminatory employment and the freedom of opinion. The law also guarantees the freedom of association of workers, trade unions and the right to strike;
- Continued support to programs such as NEP, KORA WIGIRE, KUREMERA, and VUP aimed at speeding up jobs creation for youth;
- Intensified vocational education and training countrywide to equip youth with hands-on- skills required to start their own business ventures;
- The roll out different programs aimed at job creation targeting the creation of about 200,000 jobs annually, especially off-farm jobs;
- Establishment of a guarantee Business Development Fund (BDF) to facilitate youth and women's access to financial capital to start their own businesses;
- The Government of Rwanda through the Ministry of Public Service and Labour (MIFOTRA) monitors application of Labour Law conducting meetings in districts with employers (Public and private companies) to explain the implications of each new Ministerial Order as they are passed and to explain existing instruments.
- MIFOTRA collaborates with the Workforce Development Authority (WDA) in particular to monitor employment of vocational training graduates with disabilities (a number of 2,525 are identified) and a tracer study is to be commissioned. MIFOTRA also collaborates with NCPD to facilitate and coordinate activities relating to employment of persons with disabilities.
- Existence of Digital Talent Policy and Smart Rwanda Mast Plan where 107,000 new jobs are created;
- Establishment of workers delegates through elections in all companies employing above 10 employees to facilitate in strengthening of social dialogue and advising employers at workplace.¹⁰⁶

106 NHRC, UPR final Assessment report on the implementation of the recommendations issued to Rwanda during the second cycle of Universal Periodic Review of 2015, January 2020, p.67.

The Coalition would like to point out the following

- Obsolete and unrealistic Minimum wage. The existing minimum wage was established long time ago in 1975 and a new minimum wage envisaged in Article 68 of the new law of 2018 is yet to be established;
- High unemployment rates especially among youth. Recent estimates have put the unemployment rate of youth at 15.4 percent compared to 17 in 2017¹⁰⁷; According to Capacity Development and Employment Services Board, from July 2014 to November 2019, 7,954 graduates benefited from internship program where 56 % are male and 44 % are female. Findings show that 58.3 % of interns that underwent internship program are employed against 41.7% that are unemployed.¹⁰⁸
- Poor working conditions especially for persons employed by the informal sector like security guards, cleaning workers, and domestic workers. This category of workers are exposed to poor wages and irregular payment, worker occupational safety and health risks, irregular contracts and limited training opportunities;
- Low level investment and engagement of private sector in the ICT;
- There is no comprehensive strategy aimed at adequately enabling the persons with disabilities access income through employment;¹⁰⁹
- Low rate of employment among persons with disabilities, 56 per cent, as indicated in the Fourth Rwanda Population and Housing Census in 2014, 77 per cent of which are in informal sector; affecting women and youth with disabilities in particular;¹¹⁰
- Systematic barriers and discrimination against persons with disabilities in the recruitment process and workplace, including the lack of reasonable accommodation, accessibility of work places, and accessible and affordable public transport;
- The lack of vocational training opportunities for persons with disabilities to gain access to employment.

107 NISR, Labour Force Survey Trends, November 2019, p.8.

108 NHRC, UPR final Assessment report on the implementation of the recommendations issued to Rwanda during the second cycle of Universal Periodic Review of 2015, January 2020, p.75.

109 Stephen Kidd and Krystle Kabare, Social Protection and Disability in Rwanda, August 2019, on <https://www.developmentpathways.co.uk/wp-content/uploads/2019/08/Social-Protection-and-Disability-in-Rwanda.pdf> visited on 12th June 2020.

110 Results from Fourth Rwanda Population and Housing Census in 2014.

Thus the Coalition recommends

- Continue to support technical, vocational education and training to meet the skills needed at the labor market;
- Continue strengthening programs such as Kora Wigire Program, Kuremera, VUP; to speed up job creation;
- Monitoring the enforcement of labor laws and make recommendations on how to improve them;
- Continue with internship program for fresh grandaunts and help them to be employed;
- Expedite the publication of the ministerial order of the new minimum wage considering the current price market;
- Increasing the budget allocation in the sector of ICT and Innovation;
- Engaging and inspiring more partners for investing in the sector of ICT and Innovation and other sectors for job creation;
- Intensified vocational education and training countrywide to equip youth with hands-on skills required to start their own business ventures;
- Revise the term of references of a guarantee Business Development Fund (BDF) to facilitate youth and women's access to financial capital to start their own businesses;
- To adopt policies and measures necessary, including specific measures, to significantly increase the employment rate of persons with disabilities, especially women and youth, in both the formal and informal sectors;
- Take effective measures against the systematic barriers and disability-based discrimination faced by persons with disabilities in accessing to employment,
- Implement training and skills development programs to facilitate the recruitment of persons with disabilities and to make them more competitive in the open job market.

3.14. Right to adequate standard of living and social protection

In relation to adequate standard of living and social protection, Rwanda received and accepted five recommendations and incorporated them into its roadmap. In addition, three recommendations enjoyed the support of Rwanda but were considered to be implemented or in the process of being implemented. The Coalition would like to commend the GoR for the following positive steps:

- Continued roll out social protection programs such as Girinka and VUP Umurenge. Girinka Programme has proven to be a real success despite some challenges encountered. By July 2017 figures gathered from the Rwanda Agriculture Board (RAB) show that Girinka initiative has so far provided cows to over 297,060 families against the target of 350,000 families by the end of the year 2017. Today, over 302.512 vulnerable persons have benefited from Girinka program.¹¹¹ Special care for children with disabilities etc.;
- Life expectancy for Rwanda in 2019 was 68.75 years which is a 0.46% increase compared to 68.44 years in 2018;¹¹²
- The budget allocated to social sectors has substantially increased: The spending under the social protection sector has realized a nominal increase, from 71.1 billion FRW in 2013/14 to 94.3 billion FRW in 2017/18 which is an increase of 32.6% and 101,7 billion FRW in 2019 which is an increase of 0.8%;¹¹³
- VUP continued to deliver social assistance by unconditional cash transfers, labour market programs/public work/productive inclusion and cash for work. The data suggests that nearly 4 in 10 households in District Sector receive FRW 7,500 per month, implying one eligible person in the household;
- Besides cash transfer payments, FARG provides educational scholarships; supports mutual health insurance payments, shelter development and rehabilitation and promotes income-generating projects.

111 RGB, Assessing Girinka Program, 2018. On http://rgb.rw/fileadmin/Key_documents/HGS/GIRINKA_REPORT_2018.pdf accessed on 15th June 2020.

112 See United Nations - World Population Prospects, on [113 MINECOFIN, Budget Framework Paper 2018/2019-2020/2021 on \[http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Framework_Papers/2018-2021_Budget_Framework_Paper.pdf\]\(http://www.minecofin.gov.rw/fileadmin/templates/documents/Budget_Management_and_Reporting_Unit/Budget_Framework_Papers/2018-2021_Budget_Framework_Paper.pdf\) visited on 4th June 2020.](https://www.macrotrends.net/countries/RWA/rwanda/life-expectancy/>Rwanda Life Expectancy 1950-2020. Wwww.macrotrends.net. Retrieved 2020-06-04.</p></div><div data-bbox=)

The Coalition would like to point out the following

- Inclusion of all different categories of vulnerable persons especially PWDs and historically marginalized groups remain inadequate in different Social protection programs especially VUP. Moreover, the process of selecting beneficiaries for different social protection programs is marred with transparency challenges;
- The amount of 7, 500 FRW (equivalent to 8 USD) per month paid as direct cash transfers for different social protection programs is not commensurate with the cost of living in Rwanda.

The Coalition thus recommends

- Put in place measures to ensure that the integration and inclusion and welfare of marginalized people and vulnerable members such as people with disabilities, historically marginalized groups, through education, adult literacy, community health insurance, and provision of decent shelter;
- Establish a rigorous system of monitoring and investigation of complaints of corruption and non-payment of community works delivered by VUP beneficiaries;
- Continue to take appropriate steps and allocate sufficient resources to social protection programs.

3.15. The Right to Water and Sanitation

One recommendation on water and sanitation enjoyed the support of Rwanda and was incorporated in the implementation roadmap of UPR recommendations. The coalition commends the Government of Rwanda for the following initiatives:

- Government approved a new national water supply and sanitation policy and their related implementation strategies;
- NST1 targets 100% cover of access to clean water by 2024;
- EICV5 shows the progress observed in the use of improved drinking water source (87% compared to 85% in EICV4) over the period of three years at national level. Usage rates are higher in urban areas (96%) compared to rural areas (85%);

- The percentage of households having access to improved sanitation increased from 83% in 2013-14 to 86% in 2016-17 and attained 87.3% in 2018-2019.¹¹⁴

The Coalition would like to point out the following

- Lack of clean water to some people especially in rural areas. Still 13% of the total population did not have access to clean water at the end of 2018.¹¹⁵
- Unreliable water supply of clean water especially during dry seasons. Media reports have indicated that some localities in the cities have gone without water for months especially during dry seasons;
- Depleting water resources resulting in high costs of service provision;
- Gaps in human resource capacity in areas of planning, project management and operation and maintenance of water sources;
- Low level of sustainability of WASH services particularly in rural areas;
- Insufficient water and wastewater treatment as well as solid waste management;

Thus the Coalition recommends

- Expedite projects to generate and distribute clean water especially in rural areas and achieve the NST1 target of availing clean water to 100% of all Rwandans;
- To reduce the walking distance to clean water especially in rural areas;
- Ensure that the cost of clean water is affordable to everyone especially for the most poor and vulnerable persons
- Increase the budget allocated to water and sanitation and wastewater treatment.

¹¹⁴ NISR, Fifth Integrated Household Living Conditions Survey Rwanda Poverty Profile Report EICV5 on https://environment.gov.rw/fileadmin/Environment_Subsector/Laws__Policies_and_Programmes/Useful_documents/EICV5_Rwanda_Poverty_Profile%20%281%29.pdf visited on 4th June 2020.

¹¹⁵ NISR, EICV5_Thematic Report, Utilities and Amenities, December 2018, p.8.

3.16. The Right to Food

In relation to the right to food, Rwanda received and accepted 1 recommendation and incorporated it into its roadmap of UPR implementation. In addition, two recommendations enjoyed the support of Rwanda but were considered to be implemented or in the process of being implemented and one recommendation did not enjoy the support of Rwanda and was thus noted. The Coalition commends the following positive steps taken by the Government:

- Continued implementation of homegrown initiatives such as *Girinka* (One cow per family), *Akarima k'igikoni* (kitchen garden) and *Igikoni cy'umudugudu* (Village kitchen), Inkongoro y'Umwana (a cup of milk per child),¹¹⁶
- Continued agricultural modernization with focus on land consolidation, irrigation, use of fertilizers and seeds. The initiation of CIP program has contributed significantly to the increase of crop productivity of priority crops. Consequently, the average yield (tones/Hectare) for priority crops on consolidated sites increased. For example, Irish potatoes increased by 28% and Bananas increased by 17%.¹¹⁷ Public sensitization campaigns on proper nutrition and balanced diet has been rolled out targeting parents and other relevant stakeholders;
- Commitment made by government to Fast-track the implementation of the Early Childhood Development Program with emphasis on fighting stunting and malnutrition;
- Percentage of food secure households increased from 80% to 81.3%, which means an increase of 1.3 % from 2015 to 2018;¹¹⁸
- Land mechanized increased from 41,010 ha to 47,060 ha; Percentage of mechanized farm operations stands at 26%; Percentage of agriculture population: 69.8%; Land consolidation: 744,739 ha in 2019A and 544,909 ha in 2019 B;¹¹⁹
- The food and nutrition budget allocation, rose from 9.235% in 2017/2018 to 9,981% in the fiscal year 2018/2019;¹²⁰
- Chronic malnutrition (stunting) for children 6-59 months has dropped from 37 percent to 35 percent between 2015 and 2018.¹²¹

116 MINAGRI, Annual report 2018-2019, p.14.

117 Ibid.

118 Rwanda 2018 | Comprehensive food security and vulnerability analysis Data collected in March-April 2018

119 See EICV5.

120 Idem.

121 Idem.

The Coalition is concerned with the following

- High malnutrition levels especially among children under-5 years of age where 36.1 % of children under the age of five are reported to be suffering from stunting;¹²²
- Inadequate funding for the Agriculture sector. The Agriculture Sector being the backbone of Rwanda's economy should receive adequate funding. Under Maputo protocol, 10% of the national budget should be allocated to the Agriculture Sector.¹²³ To the contrary, the GoR of Rwanda reduced the budget from 5% of the total national budget to 4% during the 2019/2020 fiscal year.¹²⁴
- Despite much investments made in key sectors like agriculture, health and social protection and poverty reduction, the trends in food security, malnutrition and poverty reduction are not commensurate with these investments.

The Coalition would like to recommend

- Increase the budget allocated to the Agriculture sector in order to intensify and consolidate programs and initiatives aimed at uprooting hunger and malnutrition.
- At minimum, at least 10% of the national budget should be allocated to the Agriculture sector;
- Intensify specific programs already initiated such as *Girinka*, *kitchen garden* and *inkongoroy'umwana*, aimed at increasing food productivity and curbing malnutrition.

3.17. The Rights of Asylum Seekers, Refugees and Migrants Workers

In relation to asylum seekers, refugees and migrant workers, Rwanda received and accepted two recommendations and incorporated them into its roadmap of UPR implementation. In addition, five recommendations enjoyed the support but were considered to be implemented or in the process of being implemented and two recommendations were rejected. The Coalition would like to commend the following:

122 Rwanda's 2019-20 National Budget : Sustaining the momentum June 2019 : <https://www.pwc.com/rw/en/pdf/rwanda-budget-analysis-2019-20.pdf> visited 23rd June 2020

123 Ibid.

124 Ibid.

- As of 31st May 2020, there are 147,630 refugees individually registered and 1,388 registered at group level in reception centres.¹²⁵ These include 76,608 refugees from DRC living in five camps (Gihembe, Kigeme, Kiziba, Mugombwa and Nyabiheke). 1,173 (1.5%) residing in urban areas. In addition, there are 3,742 Congolese asylum-seekers residing in the camps, of which some are expected to be recognized as refugees during the ongoing verification exercise. Rwanda has also been a host to over 72,000 Burundian refugees who fled insecurity and unrest due to the political situation. The vast majority live in Mahama refugee camp while 10,481 (14.6%) live in urban areas, mainly in Kigali and Huye. In addition, there are a further 49 refugees from other countries (10 African countries and one Caribbean country) living in Rwanda.¹²⁶ A group of 308 migrants from Libya is in Gashora ETM Centre in Bugesera district;
- Under the Comprehensive Refugee Response Framework and Global Compact on Refugees, the GoR made 4 commitments to assist refugees namely; Education, *Mutuel de Santé*, Self-reliance and identification for refugees;
- GoR's line Ministry in charge of Refugees (MINEMA) works with different international and local development partners for example ADRA in promoting the welfare of refugees in relation to health, food, education and hygiene as well as the Legal Aid Forum specifically provides legal assistance to refugees;
- In 2016, 5,781 Rwandans from different countries returned while from January 2017 up to the end of last year 14,831 were received. Those repatriated were helped to get a one year health insurance cover, food packages lasting for three months, identity cards. They were also supported to start small income generating businesses where each adult was given US \$250 while each child received US \$150;
- The Government of Rwanda has adopted progressive policies to support refugee self-reliance. This enabling environment includes refugees having freedom of movement and the right to work;
- On 14 February 2018, the Government of Rwanda officially adhered to the Comprehensive Refugee Response Framework (CRRF).

125 MINEMA, Rwanda country report, Country Refugee Response Plan January 2020-December 2021 on <http://reporting.unhcr.org/sites/default/files/Rwanda%20Country%20Refugee%20Response%20Plan%202020-2021%20-%20March%202020.pdf> visited on 12th June 2020.

126 UNHCR, Rwanda Country Refugee Response Plan 2019-2020, <https://reliefweb.int/report/rwanda/rwanda-country-refugee-response-plan-2019-2020>

This policy allowed 58,000 refugees to enjoy banking services and delivered ID cards and travel documents to 160,000 refugees¹²⁷. The new ID will enable refugees to travel abroad for business and education opportunities and in the labour market. The new policy allowed also 30,000 urban refugees into the national health insurance scheme and Improved refugee children's inclusion in the national education system;

- Different tripartite agreement of partnership (GoR, UNHCR and NGOs) were signed. For example, the Legal Aid Forum specifically provides legal assistance to refugees. It also supports child registration and identification;
- Supporting small projects generating income to refugees for self-reliance in order to improve their living conditions;
- Refugee students are provided with education facilities in the camps. 39,841 refugee students of Mahama, Kigeme, Mugombwa, Nyabiheke and Gihembe camps were integrated in schools for all levels of education for 2018 academic year and provided required facilities.¹²⁸

The coalition would like to point out the following issues:

- There is limited access to universal insurance scheme for migrant workers;¹²⁹
- Insufficient food quantities supplied to refugees. In 2018, there was a fatal strike in Kiziba refugee camp, over inadequate food quantities.¹³⁰
- Congested schools in refugee camps. For example *Groupe Scolaire Paysannat I*, serving Refugees in Mahama camp is the most overcrowded school in Rwanda with almost 24,000 students.¹³¹
- Most refugees depend on aid, their mind-set is not yet set to adjust for the self-reliance model.

127 Rwanda Country Refugee Response Plan 2019-2020, on <https://reliefweb.int/sites/reliefweb.int/files/resources/69632.pdf> visited on 12th June 2020.

128 MINEDUC, Annual Report 2019.

129 See, Alternative Report on International Convention on the protection of the rights of all migrant workers and members of the families, GLIDH, 2017.

130 Reuters, Five refugees killed, 20 injured, in Rwanda camp food protest: police, <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-rwanda-congo-refugees/five-refugees-killed-20-injured-in-rwanda-camp-food-protest-police-idUSKCN1G70FT>.

131 Glory Iribagiza & Ange Iliza, Inside Rwanda's most overcrowded school on <https://www.newtimes.co.rw/news/inside-rwandas-most-overcrowded-school> visited on 3rd June 2020.

Thus the Coalition recommends

- Continued joint collaboration with the Ministry in Charge of Emergency Management to advocate and find needed solution for refugees, asylum seekers and migrants workers;
- Continue the provision of education and health services and other needed social assistance for asylum seekers, refugees and migrant workers;
- Awareness for mindset change of the refugees towards self-reliance;
- Increase budget allocated to refugee feeding program.

4. Conclusion

The coalition was impressed by the spirit of co-operation exhibited by Government institutions during data collection. As opposed to previous years, Institutions visited showed a great progress in terms of understanding of what UPR is about and their obligations to report about implementation of recommendations.

The Government of Rwanda made good progress in the implementation of UPR recommendations. Some of them can rated as “fully implemented” others as “implementation in progress” and a few as “not implemented”.

We recommend the Government of Rwanda to expeditiously implement those recommendations accepted including those qualified as “implementation in progress”.

Generally, the coalition calls upon the Government of Rwanda to implement all the recommendations herein. Specifically, there is need for all institutions concerned with implementation of specific recommendations to keep disaggregated data (both quantitative and qualitative) on different actions and indicators in order to ascertain real time progress realized in the implementation of the recommendations.



**KIMIHURURA, KG 668,
BP 5225 Kigali – Rwanda
Tel: [+250]-280036090
[+250] – 0788307174
Email: legalaidrwanda@gmail.com
Website: www.legalaidrwanda.org**